

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC HEARING ON
COMCAST'S FORMAL PROPOSAL FOR FRANCHISE RENEWAL
AND PAST PERFORMANCE UNDER ITS FRANCHISES
WITH THE NSCC'S MEMBER CITIES

April 17, 2014
Commencing at 6:30 p.m.

REPORTED BY: KELLEY E. ZILLES, RPR
www.paradigmreporting.com

1 Public Hearing held on the 17th day of April 2014,
2 commencing at 6:30 p.m., at the Shoreview City Council
3 Chambers, 4600 Victoria Street North, Shoreview,
4 Minnesota, before Kelley E. Zilles, Registered
5 Professional Reporter and a Notary Public of and for the
6 State of Minnesota.

7 *****

8
9 APPEARANCES

10
11 Panel Members:

12
13 Steve Beilke, North Oaks, Chairman

14 Barb Haake, Mounds View, Secretary

15 Hal Gray, St. Anthony

16 Craig Wilson, Arden Hills

17 Dan Roe, Roseville

18 Gina Bauman, New Brighton

19 Ady Wickstrom, Shoreview

20 Jeff Dains, Lauderdale

21 Steve Gazzetta, Legal Counsel

22 Coralie Wilson, Executive Director

1 MR. BEILKE: Good evening and welcome to
2 this special meeting of the North Suburban
3 Communications Commission being held on Thursday,
4 April 17th, 2014 at the Shoreview City Council Chambers
5 at 4600 North Victoria Street in Shoreview, Minnesota.
6 Madam Secretary, may we call the roll.

7 MS. HAAKE: Arden Hills.

8 MR. WILSON: Craig Wilson.

9 MS. HAAKE: Falcon Heights. Lauderdale.

10 MR. DAINS: Jeff Dains.

11 MS. HAAKE: Little Canada. Mounds View,
12 Barbara Haake. New Brighton.

13 MS. BAUMAN: Gina Bauman.

14 MS. HAAKE: North Oaks.

15 MR. BEILKE: Steve Beilke.

16 MS. HAAKE: Roseville.

17 MR. ROE: Dan Roe.

18 MS. HAAKE: St. Anthony.

19 MR. GRAY: Hal Gray.

20 MS. HAAKE: Shoreview.

21 MS. WICKSTROM: Ady Wickstrom.

22 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Madam Secretary.

23 The North Suburban Communications Commission was
24 established by a joint powers agreement among the cities
25 of Arden Hills, Falcon Heights, Lauderdale, Little

1 Canada, Mounds View, New Brighton, North Oaks,
2 Roseville, St. Anthony, and Shoreview, Minnesota for the
3 purpose of jointly administering and enforcing the cable
4 franchise agreements between the cable service provider
5 and the member cities. The Commission is currently in
6 the process of reviewing the formal proposal submitted
7 to the Commission by Comcast of Minnesota, Inc. on
8 December 20th of 2013 seeking the renewal of its current
9 franchises under which it provides cable television
10 services to residents of the ten member cities. The
11 purpose of the Commission's review is to determine
12 whether Comcast's proposal would meet identified
13 community cable related needs and interest for the ten
14 member cities taking cost into consideration.

15 In addition to reviewing this renewal proposal
16 the Commission is also considering Comcast's past
17 performance under applicable laws and the current cable
18 franchises awarded by the member cities. The Commission
19 will ultimately make a recommendation to the member
20 cities as to whether they should accept Comcast's
21 renewal proposal or preliminarily deny Comcast's renewal
22 proposal. A preliminary denial will be just that,
23 preliminary, it will not be a final decision. Comcast
24 will have the opportunity to request a public hearing on
25 its proposal before any final action is taken by the

1 member cities.

2 As part of its review process the Commission is
3 conducting this public hearing tonight. The purposes of
4 this public hearing are, one, to allow Comcast to
5 describe and explain its formal franchise renewal
6 proposal; and two, to present interested persons and
7 organizations to express their views on Comcast's past
8 performance in terms of customer service and other
9 issues, on the technical quality of the cable system,
10 and on the formal cable television franchise renewal
11 proposal submitted by Comcast.

12 Please note that while the Commission is
13 interested in subscribers' past experience with Comcast
14 customer service including the call centers, the Xfinity
15 stores, billing and installation, this is not the time
16 or the place to present new complaints. If you have a
17 new complaint about your cable television service we
18 provided forms at the back of the room and we ask you to
19 complete one of those forms and return it to our staff
20 there.

21 Please note that under federal law the
22 Commission's authority to regulate the rates charged by
23 Comcast and the programming appearing on cable channels
24 other than the public, educational and government access
25 channels is very limited. And the Commission also has

1 very limited authority over Internet and telephone
2 service. So please, limit your comments regarding
3 Comcast customer service, the current system, and any
4 other issues to those involving cable television
5 service.

6 I also want to remind the commissioners and
7 everyone else here tonight, this public hearing is
8 designed to allow Comcast and members of the public to
9 provide information and express their opinions to the
10 Commission. This public hearing is not the appropriate
11 time and place for commissioners to express their
12 opinions, respond to questions, or engage in discusses
13 for the purpose of making any decisions. Tonight we
14 want to listen to Comcast and the public.

15 All comments furnished at this hearing will be
16 transcribed and may be considered by the Commission and
17 the member cities in deciding whether to accept or
18 preliminarily deny the Comcast formal renewal proposal.
19 The record of tonight's public hearing will remain open
20 for the submission of written testimony and/or written
21 comments until May 1st, 2014 when the Commission will
22 close the public hearing during its regularly scheduled
23 meeting.

24 This hearing is an open and public meeting
25 subject to the same statutory requirements as a meeting

1 of the city council of any member city. Public
2 participation is encouraged and members of the public
3 may address the Commission. Public comments to the
4 Commission are limited to three minutes per person
5 unless extended at the sole discretion of the chair.
6 Any groups addressing the Commission are encouraged to
7 designate a spokesperson who will be permitted to speak
8 for six minutes unless the period of time is extended at
9 the sole discretion of the chair. By the term
10 spokesperson we mean one person commenting for an
11 entity, vendor, organization or a group as opposed to a
12 personal comment or comments of an individual
13 representing only himself or herself. When addressing
14 the Commission please clearly state your name and
15 address for the record. All participants and attendees
16 are expected to participate in a respectful and
17 courteous manner.

18 May I please have a motion to open tonight's
19 public hearing.

20 MS. BAUMAN: So moved.

21 MR. BEILKE: And is there a second?

22 MR. ROE: Second.

23 MR. BEILKE: Any discussion? All in favor
24 of an open public hearing say aye.

25 ALL RESPOND: Aye.

1 MR. BEILKE: Opposed? I declare this
2 meeting open.

3 Next may I also have a motion to accept all of
4 the written comments that have already been submitted to
5 Commission staff for the purpose of this meeting and
6 enter the same into the record of this public hearing?

7 MR. ROE: So moved.

8 MR. BEILKE: And second?

9 ALL RESPOND: Second.

10 MR. BEILKE: Any discussion? All in favor
11 of approving that motion say aye.

12 ALL RESPOND: Aye.

13 MR. BEILKE: Opposed? That motion is
14 approved, the comments are accepted and made part of the
15 record of this public hearing. Staff is directed to
16 mark and identify all of those comments for inclusion in
17 the record.

18 Before jumping ahead I think I probably ought to
19 comment on a few ground rules. I thank you all for
20 coming, I know it's a bit warm and hopefully there is
21 enough room for you all. I do want to ask just like in
22 any public meeting, we would ask folks to turn off their
23 cell phones or at least turn off the sound so we don't
24 get interrupted by chimes or whatever. People do
25 receive calls.

1 I will also mention especially for the
2 commissioners here that we got a system where
3 microphones have to be turned on and off and we'll try,
4 and especially the folks in our control room, if your
5 microphone is off and you want to speak we'll need to
6 push that red button to speak, turn it off if you like
7 once you're done, but you'll notice if the light is on
8 the microphone is live.

9 Lastly because we do have so many folks wanting
10 to comment, we've set some time parameters for people's
11 comments. We are going to have a timekeeper, Ms. Haake
12 will let you know when you've got one minute left and
13 then when your time is up. So please cooperate with us
14 and we'll try and hear from everybody tonight because we
15 really want to hear from you. Can everybody see that
16 okay? Excellent. So the place for public speaking with
17 the microphone obviously is right there in front of the,
18 of the Commission.

19 So, let's see. I think the first thing we want
20 to do is hear from Comcast and their discussion and
21 description of the proposal. And I understand that
22 their counsel Mr. Tietjen is here to speak on behalf of
23 Comcast, is that right?

24 MR. TIETJEN: That's correct.

25 MR. BEILKE: Welcome.

1 MR. TIETJEN: Thank you. Thank you and
2 good evening, everyone. I have a presentation that
3 should show up on the screen here to help me along the
4 way.

5 My name is Randy Tietjen, I'm a partner in the
6 law firm of Robins, Kaplan, Miller & Ciresi and I
7 represent Comcast. Thank you for this opportunity to
8 talk to you tonight about Comcast's formal proposal for
9 the renewal of the franchise. I have with me tonight
10 several representatives of Comcast and between them and
11 me, we're happy to try to answer any questions that you
12 might have. If anyone has any questions about their
13 service it may be better directed to the representatives
14 of Comcast than, than to me. But any time you have any
15 questions please, please let me know and we'll try to
16 help you out.

17 I have an understanding about this Commission's
18 process that's consistent with the process that you
19 described at the outset, that is that the Commission
20 intends to vote in early May on a resolution whether to
21 approve or to preliminarily deny or to recommend whether
22 the member cities of this Commission approve or
23 preliminarily deny the proposal for a franchise renewal
24 by Comcast. And then approximately a month later as I
25 understand it the member cities themselves will be

1 deciding whether to approve or whether to preliminarily
2 deny the franchise application.

3 Now that makes this process and your role in it
4 very important because to make your decision you're
5 going to need to know a lot of facts and a fair amount
6 of law. And if you were to make a recommendation, for
7 example, that the renewal of the franchise must be
8 preliminarily denied, which we believe would be a
9 mistake, it could be a very costly and time consuming
10 process for everyone involved and in the end we believe
11 fruitless.

12 So you have a copy of course of your own quite
13 lengthy report, an RFP that you directed to Comcast, and
14 you have of course our equally lengthy response to the
15 RFP. And you'll, in your report you included technical
16 evaluations of Comcast's system by a consulting group, a
17 report and survey of sorts on the purported community
18 cable related needs by a consultant who is a prominent
19 advocate for PEG programming and you included a separate
20 financial analysis of Comcast. And our response
21 included a report of a financial expert on the NSCC and
22 the NSAC's finances, what we believe is a statistically
23 valid report by a survey expert measuring customer
24 satisfaction and preferences, among other things,
25 including a critique of the methods of your survey

1 consultant.

2 We also included an expert report on the fair
3 market value of the system's institutional network, and
4 we included a report by a professor of journalism in law
5 and an expert on mass communication who's analyzing the
6 trends of local media, the NSAC's PEG programming and
7 the NSCC's RFP. So you have a lot of information before
8 you and these are lengthy documents to say the least,
9 and I don't have time to cover anywhere near all of
10 them, and you don't want to listen to me talk that long
11 anyway.

12 This has been a two-year process that you have
13 elected to expend a lot of resources on to conduct this
14 formal renewal. And I have to say virtually all cable
15 franchise renewals around the country, virtually all of
16 them, no matter what company is the cable operator, are
17 conducted faster, more informally and cheaper. But this
18 formal process is the one that you have triggered and
19 the one that is the track that we're on.

20 In this Commission's RFP you make some what we
21 believe are some rather remarkable demands from Comcast.
22 And I'll get into these in a little more detail, but you
23 want, you want Comcast customers who are already paying
24 one of the highest PEG fees in the country to pay even
25 more. You want Comcast customers to fund the

1 operational expenses of this Commission and the NSAC
2 which is an unlawful demand. You haven't offered any
3 solution for the non-use or the misuse of customers'
4 franchise fees. And the NSAC operates eight channels,
5 eight channels that replay much of the same programming
6 over and over, and yet your RFP demands even more
7 channels when you aren't filling the ones that you have
8 with any fresh programming.

9 And we offered on the other hand what we believe
10 are reasonable and lawful PEG fees. And we offered to
11 help you make your PEG programming more effective
12 including by simply reducing the sheer number of
13 channels. Now I'll get into all of this in a little
14 more detail in a few minutes, but by this stage I'm also
15 sure that you are aware of Comcast's involvement in the
16 community in the Twin Cities.

17 Comcast has spent \$1.6 billion, 1.6 billion on
18 the infrastructure in this region since 1996, including
19 80 million on the head-in facility in Roseville.
20 Comcast provides free services to over 700 schools and
21 libraries in the Twin Cities as well as many municipal
22 buildings. Comcast generates countless volunteers for
23 worthy causes including Comcast Care Stage which is
24 coming up.

25 Comcast has connected 7,000 area low income

1 families with affordable broadband through the Internet
2 Essentials program. Comcast is a leader in
3 communications technology with leading edge technology
4 in broadband, for example. Comcast works closely here
5 in the suburbs, in the north suburbs with the Northeast
6 Youth and Family Services and The Roseville Oval.
7 Comcast pays \$102 million annually in state and local
8 taxes and fees.

9 In 2013 alone Comcast provided more than
10 \$3 million of charitable support in the Twin Cities
11 areas. And Comcast employs over 1,800 people in this
12 region including 72 who work at the Fairview Avenue
13 facility in Roseville. And those employees are proud to
14 work in a place that has been voted one of the best
15 places to work for the past eight years by Business
16 Journal. So Comcast in short is a member, a proud
17 member of this community and proud to offer the high
18 quality cable services it does to north suburb
19 customers.

20 Now what I'd like to do with the time I have is
21 to review for you four important questions that are
22 involved in your review of Comcast's proposal. As your
23 lawyer has no doubt told you, many years ago Congress
24 decided, Congress decided because of the substantial
25 investment that a cable operator makes in the system

1 that when it comes time for renewal the local franchise
2 authorities such as the member cities of this Commission
3 have only four grounds on which they can deny a renewal
4 of the franchise. So while this Commission plays an
5 ongoing role in regulating certain aspects of cable
6 operations in the member cities, now while there might
7 be questions that arise out of that role, questions that
8 Comcast would be happy to address in a regulatory
9 capacity of this body, when it comes to the renewal of
10 the franchises, Congress decided that there are only
11 four grounds on which denial at the end of the day can
12 be based. And those same four grounds then if this
13 matter goes to the stage where there's an administrative
14 hearing, they translate into four questions that the
15 administrative law judge is going to consider, and those
16 four questions are the same questions that you need to
17 consider. Because if the evidence is going to show that
18 the answers to the questions favor renewal, then a
19 preliminary rejection of renewal by the member cities
20 would be wasteful and pointless. So if I could, let me
21 review each of the four questions that you have to
22 decide and show briefly why there is no doubt that this
23 Commission should recommend renewal.

24 The first question. The first question is has
25 Comcast substantially complied with the material terms

1 of the franchise and with applicable law. The simple
2 answer to this question is yes, Comcast has
3 substantially complied. But let me begin on a little
4 more detailed answer with this fact. This Commission in
5 its report and RFP did not identify any instances in
6 which it believes Comcast has not substantially complied
7 with the franchise or applicable law, not one.

8 Now on the chance that someone tries to make a
9 belated argument against Comcast, let me give you a
10 point of law, a point of law that is likely the reason
11 why no one asserted that there was any substantial
12 noncompliance. A Federal Court in New York 20 years ago
13 decided what represents a material breach of a cable
14 television franchise. And I'd be happy to supply you
15 with a copy of the decision, I'm sure that your lawyer
16 has it. The case was called Cable Vision Systems versus
17 Town of East Hampton. And in that case the court said
18 that a material breach of a franchise agreement is a
19 departure from performance or a defect in performance
20 that pervades the whole franchise or that substantially
21 defeats the object of the franchise. Now nothing in
22 Comcast's operation of these cable franchises rises to
23 that level.

24 Disputes are going to come up now and again
25 between the Commission and Comcast often involving

1 interpretations of the franchise and of law, but none of
2 those have been material, none have so pervaded the
3 whole franchise or substantially defeated the object of
4 the franchise.

5 The second question that the Commission has to
6 ask itself in the formal renewal proceeding is this, has
7 the quality of Comcast services been reasonable in light
8 of community needs. And here again the answer is
9 unequivocally yes. Now as with the first question,
10 neither the Commission's report nor the RFP provided any
11 notice that Comcast services are unreasonable in light
12 of community needs. There was no notice, no opportunity
13 to cure, therefore no ground for denying renewal.

14 The fact that there was no notice is not
15 surprising because this Commission's own survey expert,
16 flawed as their methodology was beyond their survey in
17 our view, confirms that this is not a basis for denying
18 renewal. Group W Communications, this Commission's own
19 consultant acknowledged the glowing reviews. And I'll
20 quote from your own consultant's report. Generally
21 cable subscribers in the NSCC service area indicate they
22 are satisfied with Comcast cable TV service. In
23 addition, very high percentages of them gave positive
24 ratings to two of the quality and service measures
25 tested and solid majorities gave positive ratings to

1 several others. That's your consultant. And Comcast's
2 consultant who followed proper methods of surveying in
3 our view found just as high or even higher levels of
4 satisfaction. So the experts are in agreement there's
5 general satisfaction with Comcast service.

6 Now please don't understand me, misunderstand
7 me. We are not saying that no one ever has problems
8 with their service or that no one has ever complained,
9 that's not it at all. It is a highly technical and
10 demanding business undergoing continual technological
11 change. But in the grand scheme of things we believe
12 that the record will show quality service for the 30
13 some thousand subscribers. To be sure of this, the
14 subscriber survey showed that a vast majority of
15 subscribers rated reliability, picture and sound quality
16 and customer service as good or very good.

17 Third question. The third question the
18 Commission has to ask itself is this, does Comcast have
19 the financial, legal and technical ability to provide
20 the services, facilities and equipment set forth in
21 Comcast's proposal. Here again the answer is yes. And
22 I answer, is it so easy that no one has even suggested
23 that Comcast doesn't have these capabilities, no one has
24 ever suggested that. And if anyone has any challenge to
25 Comcast's proposal on this question it would be news, it

1 would be news to probably everyone in this room.

2 The fourth question, is Comcast's proposal
3 reasonable to meet the future cable related community
4 needs and interest, taking into account the cost of
5 meeting those needs and interest. This is the question
6 with the most facts, the most complicated analysis
7 behind it. But in the end the answer is no less easy
8 than it is in the first question once you understand the
9 facts, and the answer is yes.

10 Now there seems to be three areas of contention
11 between the Commission's report and RFP and Comcast's
12 proposal. One, funding the operations of this
13 Commission and of its sister organization, the NSAC
14 which operates the PEG channels. Two, the number of
15 local access channels available to the NSAC. And three,
16 the institutional network or iNET. Let me address each
17 of these in turn if I could.

18 Let's take up the first area of contention,
19 funding the NSCC, this Commission and the NSAC, which
20 I'll refer to jointly as just the NSCC. And then
21 funding the member cities own PEG operations, which
22 generally involve the broadcast of city council meetings
23 on PEG channels, as what they do in this chamber.

24 Funding involves two broad categories of
25 expense, capital needs such as cameras and other

1 equipment, and operational expenses such as salaries.
2 Currently every cent that the NSCC, this Commission and
3 the member cities currently use to fund PEG comes from
4 Comcast customers in the form of franchise fees and PEG
5 fees. Comcast collects these fees at your behest and
6 forwards the money either to you or to member cities.

7 Now under the Cable Act and the FCC rulings
8 there is a clear division of responsibilities for
9 funding. A cable operator like Comcast provides the
10 channel capacity on the system and funding for
11 reasonably adequate capital needs in the form of PEG
12 fees. The local franchise authority, the member cities
13 of this Commission provide the operational funds for
14 PEG. And that can come from franchise fees or from what
15 other source the member city finds.

16 Now let's look at what you said you needed for
17 capital funding first. The Cable Act and FCC have
18 limited capital funding to what is needed to pay for
19 adequate PEG facilities. Under the current franchise,
20 PEG capital funding under the current franchise, PEG
21 capital funding was less than a hundred thousand dollars
22 per year for 15 years or about \$0.27 per customer.

23 In your RFP for the next franchise you demanded
24 more than \$14 million over a franchise term of ten
25 years, a more than ten-fold increase. 8.6 million of

1 that was for the NSAC's purported capital needs. This
2 alone would amount to \$2.36 per customer per month for
3 ten years. And then you wanted Comcast customers to pay
4 approximately 400 to \$500,000 or more for each of the
5 ten member cities purported capital needs.

6 Comcast offered by its proposal to collect PEG
7 fees totalling 1.6 million over ten years of the NSAC's
8 capital spending in the form of \$0.44 per customer per
9 month. And now that is nearly double, nearly double the
10 current amount of \$0.27 per month. In addition, we will
11 collect from customers PEG fees for almost all of the
12 capital funds that you said each of the member cities
13 need which would result in an additional \$3.2 million in
14 funding.

15 Now the NSAC, this Commission, the NSAC has
16 about \$2.1 million in reserves, at least you did as of
17 2012, which in our view is an unreasonably high amount
18 for a nonprofit that has a virtually guaranteed stream
19 of income. We propose that just half of that reserve be
20 applied on a pro rata basis to reduce the capital needs
21 that you say each member city has.

22 Now in your proposal we did not question the
23 Commission's demand for 400 or more, 500,000 for the ten
24 member cities purported capital needs, but your RFP
25 would require the customers in the larger cities, the

1 customers in the larger cities to subsidize the capital
2 costs or needs of the people in the smaller communities.
3 If Lauderdale needs all new cameras and other capital
4 needs we didn't question it, but our proposal would not
5 require the customers who live in Roseville, for
6 example, which has more customers to subsidize the cost
7 of cameras, new cameras for Lauderdale. The customers
8 of Roseville shouldn't be subsidizing the cost of new
9 cameras for Lauderdale. The PEG viewers and the
10 customers in a city like Lauderdale if they need
11 \$450,000 worth of new equipment shouldn't have to pay
12 the PEG fees to the support the city's purported capital
13 needs.

14 All of this is explained thoroughly in our
15 proposal. And overall at the end of the day these are
16 significant PEG capital grants that Comcast is offering
17 and they would certainly pay for adequate PEG
18 facilities. Of course during a hearing on judicial
19 process if we get to that point, if that's necessary the
20 capital needs claimed by this Commission's consultant
21 will be under a microscope and we will expect that a
22 detailed and unbiased review of the facilities and
23 equipment will show that the staff's demands exceed the
24 limitations under the Cable Act.

25 Now in addition to more than 14 million in

1 capital funding, and I apologize for the line through
2 that, you've demanded that Comcast customers pay PEG
3 fees to support the operational expenses of the NSAC and
4 NSCC in the amount of 13.5 or 13.6 million over ten
5 years. That would be an additional \$3.71 per customer
6 every year for ten years, which combined with your
7 capital demands from customers would drive customers'
8 total PEG fees to \$7.50 on average per customer per
9 month for the next ten years.

10 Today this Commission and your ten member cities
11 require Comcast customers to each pay \$4.15 in PEG fees.
12 This as I said is already one of the highest PEG fees in
13 the nation. Neither your staff nor your counsel has
14 ever offered any information that disputes that. So a
15 customer in one of your ten cities who has a standard
16 basic service at \$13.78 a month currently pays an
17 additional \$4.15 in PEG fees. And you propose by your
18 RFP to nearly double that. Instead of \$4.15 a month,
19 you would have the customer pay \$7.50 a month delivered
20 to you to fund PEG channels, PEG channels as we should
21 see that relatively few people are watching. That's not
22 only wrong, it is unlawful. And there's apparently no
23 disagreement on this point, that it is unlawful for you
24 to conditionally renew the PEG fees on paying for your
25 operational expenses.

1 Your operating support if it's going to be
2 funded by Comcast customers has to come out of the
3 franchise fee revenue. Here the 5 percent franchise fee
4 that your member cities will collect will total
5 approximately 15.5 million over the next ten years. And
6 funding the NSCC, NSAC's operational expenses with the
7 franchise fees is actually what the member cities
8 already agreed to do when they entered into their joint
9 powers agreement that you mentioned at the outset of
10 this hearing. Did you know that? Article 10, Section 3
11 of the joint powers agreement, the member cities all
12 agreed that the franchise fees that they collected would
13 only be used for cable related expenses.

14 Now from our review of the city's financial
15 information, that's not how the franchise fees are being
16 used. A relatively small portion of the franchise fees
17 is provided to this Commission and then the rest is
18 retained by the cities. Based on our review of the
19 records that are publicly available, we believe that at
20 least some of the member cities have accumulated a
21 substantial amount of franchise fees which they are
22 obligated under the joint powers agreement to spend on
23 cable related needs. All of this accumulation of fees
24 paid by Comcast customers, and still the Commission
25 wants Comcast subscribers to pay more.

1 Now let's talk about what the NSCC is trying to
2 fund with all these fees. The north suburbs use eight
3 channels under the current franchise and two of those
4 channels are not even being used for local programs.
5 One of the channels is just a feed from NASA which any
6 interested viewers could watch on NASA's Web site. Our
7 survey showed that subscribers could not identify a
8 single PEG channel and that the vast majority of
9 respondents between 78 and 94 percent seldom or never
10 watch the eight channels. 80 percent of survey
11 respondents did not want to pay any amount for PEG
12 programming, 80 percent of the survey respondents. Your
13 own consultant's survey, as flawed as her methods were,
14 showed that the vast majority, 77 to 85 percent rarely
15 or never watch most of the channels. And your survey
16 consultant appeared to be carefully avoiding telling
17 people in trying to measure their interest in these
18 channels that they would have to pay something for them.
19 What a person will accept at no cost and what a person
20 is willing to pay are often, often two different things.

21 So with this kind of viewership the Commission
22 wants Comcast customers to pay nearly twice as much more
23 a month to support PEG programing. Comcast survey
24 consultant asked customers what they wanted to pay for
25 PEG programming, and the medium amount, zero. Most

1 people didn't place any value on the additional costly
2 features that the Commission wants like high definition
3 format.

4 Now I have heard your staff Ms. Wilson say that
5 if PEG fees that customers pay are reduced, nothing will
6 change in the bills for customers because the money
7 saved will go right to Comcast headquarters in
8 Philadelphia, I heard her say that. And when I hear her
9 say that I wondered myself if she has ever looked at the
10 bills of customers in other communities in the Twin
11 Cities. Comcast has a standard pricing structure, so
12 generally a standard basic package or a digital
13 preferred package is going to cost the same in Mounds
14 View as it would in Woodbury or Edina. The only
15 significant difference is in the amount of the PEG fees
16 that someone who lives in Mounds View is going to pay.

17 The number of channels that the Commission
18 should have available is a significant difference
19 between us. Your RFP apparently wants to keep current
20 eight standard definition PEG channels and add an
21 additional four high definition channels plus some
22 unspecified quantity of video on demand capacity.

23 Comcast's proposal is more than reasonable to
24 meet the future PEG needs and interest given the level
25 of real interest in PEG programming, despite the best

1 efforts of a large staff and many volunteers and given
2 the unchallenged fact that the NSAC plays the same
3 programming on its current eight channels often dozens
4 or many dozens of times. The NSAC's programming often
5 lacks freshness, days on end playing the same program
6 because the NSAC needs to fill the time available on
7 eight channels.

8 Comcast proposes to provide four strong PEG
9 channels, three strong definition and one in high
10 definition, with an opportunity to add a channel based
11 on actual use. Comcast will also help the NSAC add
12 programing information for the PEG channels to the
13 digital channel guide. The number of PEG channels that
14 Comcast is offering is more than reasonable in light of
15 cable television and the programs of the NSAC.

16 When the current franchise was entered into in
17 1998 there were many fewer places that people could turn
18 to for local information or local news. PEG now
19 competes with vastly expanded sources including blogs,
20 Twitter, Internet streaming, Facebook, YouTube, all of
21 which affect the need for PEG channels. I urge you to
22 review the report of Professor Saunders on this topic
23 which is attached to our proposal.

24 Now I have also heard Ms. Wilson of your staff
25 argue recently in the city council of the member cities

1 that Comcast is trying to "Kill" the NSAC's PEG
2 operations. Nothing could be further from the truth.
3 Our proposal to fund the reasonable capital needs of the
4 NSAC and the member cities is evidence of that.
5 Statements like Ms. Wilson's do not help our attempt to
6 have a reasonable discussion about the realities of PEG
7 operations of NSAC. We want to make PEG better. There
8 is nothing local that the NSAC broadcast, that would be
9 lost if it were broadcast a reasonable number of times
10 using four channels rather than being broadcast over and
11 over and again and again to fill the time available on
12 eight channels.

13 You may or may not know that your report also
14 demands that Comcast provide a complimentary iNET that
15 is a full scale data and telecommunications network to
16 the Commission and member cities. Now your report and
17 the RFP do not provide any information showing current
18 usage, expected needs, or any community interest in the
19 iNET. You just demand it and ask for capital funding
20 for the network paid by Comcast subscribers. Federal
21 law meanwhile treats demands unrelated to PEG use and in
22 kind gifts that count towards the franchise fee limit.
23 So Comcast has made the following proposal which we
24 believe is reasonable. Comcast will provide an iNET
25 comparable to that under the current franchise and

1 Comcast will offer the portion of the network used for
2 PEG purposes for no charge to the NSAC. Again, to the
3 extent the iNET is used for transmission of PEG
4 programing, Comcast will provide a network free of
5 charge to the NSCC. But if the NSCC wants to use the
6 iNET for more than that, for example, for Internet and
7 data services for telephone and if the City of Roseville
8 leverages as it does the iNET for its own commercial
9 gain, then Comcast shall be able to seek the fair market
10 value of that portion. If the city is refusing to pay
11 fair market value, then the law provides that Comcast
12 can include that in kind value as part of the franchise
13 fee limit.

14 In conclusion as we discussed, none of the four
15 grounds we reviewed justify denial. Now there is some
16 serious procedural and substantive problems with the
17 flawed reports that this Commission's demands were
18 based. The only lawful choice is to accept Comcast's
19 proposal, or we complete the renewal the way 99.9
20 percent of the renewals are done, informally,
21 efficiently and less costly. Thank you for your time.

22 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Mr. Tietjen. All
23 right. Next we're going to move on to some brief
24 comments from our staff. And I believe, Cora, are you
25 going to take the lead on that, or Steve is.

1 MR. GAZZETTA: In light of the chair's
2 comments earlier about this is really a time to hear
3 from Comcast and the public, I will just state that on
4 behalf of staff and the Commission as the Commission's
5 attorney, we obviously disagree with a number of the
6 factual and legal conclusions set forth in Mr. Tietjen's
7 presentation. I think staff's position will ultimately
8 be brought to the Commission for consideration at the
9 appropriate time and that the Commission and the access
10 corporation obviously reserve all of their rights,
11 remedies and defenses with respect to the formal and
12 informal renewal processes. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

13 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Mr. Gazzetta. No
14 other comments from staff? We'll move on then to an
15 opportunity for commissioners who wish to ask any
16 questions of Comcast. Does anyone wish to ask any
17 questions? Ady.

18 MS. WICKSTROM: Thank you. We've been
19 working on an informal process parallel to this formal
20 process. Is there any chance that that could be, we
21 could come to a resolution through that process and
22 avoid the legal complications of the formal process?

23 MR. TIETJEN: Oh, we hope very much. And
24 we've worked very hard to try to achieve that. And, and
25 I didn't, I don't want to leave any doubt that at the

1 end of my remarks it's the invitation to that informal
2 process that I wanted to leave open.

3 MS. WICKSTROM: Is it realistic though with
4 the time frame looming?

5 MR. TIETJEN: Yes, definitely. This is,
6 this is a very, this whole matter is very much a concern
7 to us and to Comcast and you have our full attention if
8 you want it. We're willing to talk to you at any time.
9 We, we very much prefer to try to resolve things more
10 efficiently and informally than through this very
11 costly, prolonged, cumbersome formal process.

12 MS. WICKSTROM: Okay. Thank you.

13 MR. BEILKE: Anyone else, any other
14 commissioners? Gina.

15 MS. BAUMAN: I just have a couple things
16 that you said.

17 MR. TIETJEN: Sure.

18 MS. BAUMAN: And I'd just like some
19 response from it.

20 MR. TIETJEN: I'll try.

21 MS. BAUMAN: You were talking about what
22 you believe is fair to this Commission that Comcast
23 should provide funding. One, doesn't Comcast get
24 funding from the same source as we do which is the
25 people who pay the bills? Now the current adequate

1 funding, I would like to know what you mean by adequate.
2 And if you take away half of the reserve that this
3 Commission has and then you want to lower the, what we
4 get as PEG fees, how do you explain that it will
5 continue to exist if you do that? So if it's not
6 replenished, you're saying you replenish it, you're the
7 ones that the funding comes from when it really doesn't
8 come from you, it comes from the customer like your
9 funding does, can you explain to me how you believe that
10 this Commission will deem to exist after that?

11 MR. TIETJEN: Sure. So as a matter of law
12 Comcast is obligated to provide capital funding for the
13 adequate capital needs of the NSAC. And adequate is
14 given the ordinary meaning, the English language, not a
15 gold plated package of equipment for the NSCC and NSAC,
16 but adequate. And for the past many years the only
17 capital funds that the NSCC and NSAC has needed amounts
18 to about 27 percent, \$0.27 of that \$4.15 that they're
19 currently paying. And what our offer with our proposal
20 is to nearly double that and to pay virtually all of the
21 capital needs that you say each of the individual cities
22 need, using half of the 2 million reserve that this
23 Commission has.

24 Now to pay the operations, the other side of the
25 NSCC, NSAC, that's to be funded by the franchise fee.

1 And this Commission, the member cities from our review
2 is not using all of the franchise fee to fund the
3 operations of this Commission. A relatively fraction, a
4 relatively small amount is sent to the NSCC, NSAC, and
5 the rest goes to the member cities. It, it's hard to
6 track, we have not had anything available to us but the
7 public financial information. Sometimes it appears to
8 go in the general fund of the city or kept in a special
9 capital reserve fund.

10 If the member cities just did what they already
11 agreed to do in the joint powers agreement, use the
12 whole franchise fee for cable operations, for cable
13 related purposes, that money could be directed to help
14 fund the operations of this Commission.

15 MS. BAUMAN: So are you saying that the
16 \$4.15 is something that you're agreeable to?

17 MR. TIETJEN: No. \$4.15 is what the
18 customers have been paying for years.

19 MS. BAUMAN: Correct.

20 MR. TIETJEN: And it includes, and this was
21 under a settlement agreement with the cable operator
22 many years ago, an amount that will help for operational
23 funding. But the law doesn't require Comcast to pay for
24 the operational funds for the Commission, nor can the
25 Commission demand that customers continue to pay such

1 high PEG fees to fund the operations of the Commission.
2 So we are not proposing in our formal proposal that the
3 PEG fees remain as high as they are now, and definitely
4 that they not go as high as your RFP would have them go
5 to \$7.50 a month per customer.

6 As you can see in Woodbury, PEG fees are a
7 dollar, in Edina they're \$0.66, in Minneapolis a dollar
8 26, and St. Paul a dollar 97. That's right here in the
9 Twin Cities. Why is the NSAC and NSCC so far, so far
10 out of the other cities in the Twin Cities.

11 MR. BEILKE: Okay. Any other questions
12 from the commissioners, other questions? Sorry, Jeff.

13 MR. DAINS: You mentioned the programming
14 that's shown over and over again. Can you give us some
15 specifics of the type of programming that you're
16 speaking to.

17 MR. TIETJEN: A great deal of the
18 programming is played over and over again. And
19 Professor Saunders I believe refers to some analysis of
20 that in her report. She's the journalism professor and
21 mass communications expert at the University of
22 Minnesota. It's some form of analysis, some summary I
23 believe of the statistics. But if you look at the
24 programming channel guide for the PEG channels, and you
25 can just look at it on the NSAC's Web site, there is a

1 monthly program schedule there, you'll see that the same
2 sports event, for example, is replayed over and over,
3 you'll see it repeated as the days go by.

4 MR. DAINS: So what you're, well, I just
5 want some clarification. So you're saying that should
6 only be shown once, or what is your proposal
7 specifically?

8 MR. TIETJEN: No, not at all, not at all,
9 and I don't want to be misunderstood on this. Our
10 proposal is that instead of eight channels, and as I
11 said two of them aren't even being used for this local
12 programming, one is for a NASA fee, but the eight
13 channels be reduced to four. And there's still plenty
14 of channel capacity, still plenty of programming hours
15 to play the programming that, that the NSCC wants to
16 play. It just doesn't need to be repeated as often as
17 it is repeated.

18 MR. BEILKE: Okay. Anybody else, any other
19 questions? Apparently not. So thank you.

20 MR. TIETJEN: Thank you very much.

21 MR. BEILKE: We will now move on to the
22 public comment portion of this meeting. We obviously
23 have a lot of folks who have come here tonight to
24 express their opinions and we want to hear all of you
25 and we thank you all for coming. What I'd like to do is

1 take the, take the comments in the order in which the
2 speakers signed in. If anyone here hasn't signed in
3 yet, please do that because I'm only going to work from
4 that list of folks who signed our log. So it's not too
5 late to go ahead and do that now if you haven't already.
6 But do sign in so we have the opportunity to recognize
7 you. And it also helps us make a formal record of
8 tonight's public hearing which is the second reason why
9 we're using that.

10 As I mentioned earlier on the comments,
11 individuals speaking on behalf of themselves we are
12 offering you three minutes. If you're speaking on
13 behalf of a group, if you're a spokesperson for a group
14 your time is six minutes. The timekeeper will let you
15 know when you're down to one minute of time. I hope
16 that's relatively clear.

17 MS. HAAKE: There's five more chairs up
18 here.

19 MS. WICKSTROM: Mr. Chair, are we going to
20 give priority to the people that live in one of the ten
21 cities? I don't know if there's people from outside
22 that are here to speak.

23 MR. BEILKE: Well, either people or
24 entities, yes, we're going to try to make sure everyone
25 is heard. We would like to hear from everybody, but we

1 will definitely try to make sure that the folks from our
2 ten member cities get the opportunity first. So are we
3 ready to go, any other comments? One question.

4 MR. ROE: Just a point of information. Can
5 we get the screen cleared.

6 MR. BEILKE: Kevin, can you clear the
7 screen, please. Folks in the back, there are some
8 chairs up front here if you want to sit down, and we'll
9 bring in more if you need them. All right. Okay.

10 The first speaker, Wayne Powers from Roseville
11 Schools. And by the way, when you first come up if you
12 would just repeat your name and your address, your city
13 for the record, the reporter will make a record of it.

14 WAYNE POWERS: Good evening.

15 MR. BEILKE: Go ahead.

16 WAYNE POWERS: I'm Wayne Powers, I'm the
17 supervisor of cable services for Roseville School
18 District. I live in Blaine, but I've worked here for
19 several years. Commissioners and council members,
20 fellow TV volunteers and representatives of Comcast, I'm
21 Wayne Michael Powers and I'm the supervisor of the
22 infrastructure and cable services for the Roseville
23 Schools. For the very activation of our cable franchise
24 in '83 and '84, and in the 30 or so years since that
25 time and as the ownership of this system has changed and

1 as the Public Access center has evolved into the seat
2 that we now know, the Roseville Area Schools has been
3 heavily involved in the use of the facilities and the
4 mobile production trucks of our Public Access center.

5 Every year using the two production trucks of
6 CTV my production group, which is a group of high school
7 and middle school students under my supervision,
8 provides coverage of more than 80 events including
9 hundreds of hours of programming including football,
10 boys and girls soccer, volleyball, girls swimming and
11 diving, boys and girls hockey, boys and girls
12 basketball, girls gymnastics, boys swimming and diving,
13 baseball, softball, boys and girls across the high
14 school council series one, two and three, the jazz
15 concerts, the district's music recitals, the
16 international club variety show, Pops, cultural shows,
17 and the high school graduations. Many of these events
18 are simulcast via the Web and many of these events
19 wouldn't be possible without access to these affiliates
20 of CTV.

21 Without the CTV and the access corporation being
22 funded at their current funding levels and without
23 access to our cable channels being retained in their
24 current configuration, we would no longer have access to
25 the production trucks and perhaps our current access

1 cable would disappear. If that were to occur then none
2 of the great things that would happen in our community
3 would be seen by that community, which would mean no
4 coverage of school events and graduation for that
5 matter.

6 Just for the record, I may be a Roseville Area
7 School employee during the day, but never in the 30 plus
8 years of using the production trucks of our access
9 center have I ever been paid for one minute of my after
10 hours time. And that amounts to thousands of hours of
11 volunteer time working with the dedicated young people
12 of Roseville who produce these programs that are seen on
13 both Roseville Schools Channel 18 and CTV.

14 The communities in our franchise cities have
15 become accustomed to seeing high school sports,
16 concerts, special events and traditional events such as
17 the Pops concerts, graduations and Rosefest parades, for
18 example. This is a great public relations opportunity
19 and a great community service. If our cable service
20 provider wants to pride themselves in serving the
21 community, then why take this ability away from our
22 communities.

23 I have heard some skepticism on the part of our
24 cable service provider that no one watches our PEG
25 channels, that what we present to the community on our

1 PEG channels are endless, mindless repeats of the same
2 programing and that what we provide to the community
3 isn't of much value. Let me take this opportunity to
4 enlighten you. Roseville is becoming an older
5 community.

6 MR. BEILKE: Time. Please wrap it up, Mr.
7 Powers.

8 WAYNE POWERS: And with that community
9 getting older, they are also showing a historically
10 strong commitment to the school district and our
11 residents continue to have a strong interest in what's
12 happening in the schools. Being able to watch the
13 students sporting events, concerts and so on on CTV and
14 our PEG channels gives us the opportunity to stay
15 connected, even if it's remotely from home.

16 Each of the three public school districts in
17 this franchise was granted an educational access
18 channel. And for over 30 years the District 650
19 productions group with the help of literally hundreds of
20 young people, many of whom never would have made it
21 through high school without this outlet, have provided
22 coverage of Roseville Area sporting events, concerts,
23 special events programming, graduations and school board
24 meetings.

25 MS. HAAKE: Just a minute, Mr. Powers. I

1 just wanted to apologize. My chair just reminded me
2 that you represent schools, so you have six minutes.

3 WAYNE POWERS: Thank you, ma'am.

4 MS. HAAKE: So I've reset to give you that
5 other three minutes.

6 WAYNE POWERS: Thank you very much, I
7 appreciate that.

8 MS. HAAKE: So the audience knows.
9 Otherwise you can see that I'm right on time.

10 WAYNE POWERS: Thank you. The AV Club of
11 your youth, of our youth now constitutes the crew
12 members of my production teams. These are young people
13 that are running cameras, mixing audio, running replays,
14 directing productions, developing life skills and making
15 friends and finding their way in the world, giving their
16 time in school some meaning, making their time in school
17 survivable, and developing life skills.

18 It would surprise you to know that a member of
19 my production's alumni Mark McPherson who's a news
20 anchor at WKBT Television in La Crosse, a CBS affiliate
21 there. Two of my alumni Bill Prouty and Jake Nyberg are
22 partners in a successful advertising agency in the Twin
23 Cities called Two Volts. And Bill Prouty regularly
24 produces program segments for the Discovery Channel.
25 Another is a production assistant at KSTP and another is

1 currently on tour with Billy Joel running sound and
2 video segments.

3 I have film students along the ranks of my
4 alumni, as well as municipal technicians, computer
5 programers, law enforcement personnel, businessmen and
6 women, bankers, dental technicians, mechanics, and so
7 on. They all got their start working with my production
8 group and CTV and Public Access. Even if they haven't
9 pursued a career in communications, they are all working
10 and contributing to society. And working with my group
11 as a team and working with productions have given them
12 the ability to work with others and have given them a
13 leg up in society.

14 Many of the crew in my, one in particular of my
15 production crew are kids that would have fallen through
16 the cracks in the educational system, kids with baggy
17 pants, multicolored Mohawks, kids from all ends of the
18 social economic spectrum, kids from all ethnicities,
19 kids that people have given up on. But when they were
20 given this opportunity they excelled and they made it
21 through.

22 To this day I have alumni who have come back
23 years and years after graduation to assist with my
24 productions. In fact, I had one man who's on leave from
25 the Air Force who stopped by the other day and asked

1 what he could do on productions while he's home for the
2 next month.

3 Our cable service provider seems to believe that
4 what we do isn't of much value to or benefits the
5 communities that we serve. I defy them to say that to
6 all the young people that have worked with me over the
7 years or to their parents.

8 In addition to showing our school activities to
9 the community, and these people actually do watch Public
10 Access television, I also get calls from parents,
11 students, grandparents even asking when a particular
12 program will be replayed or shown on cable and ask me
13 how they can obtain a copy of the production that either
14 their child or grandchild have participated in. I've
15 had athletes call me, come into my office, reviewed
16 programming and create highlighted reels for college
17 recruiters.

18 MR. BEILKE: Mr. Powers, are you near the
19 end? Your six minutes are up.

20 WAYNE POWERS: Okay. I'm almost finished,
21 sir. I've had officials come into production trucks and
22 take a look at what we're doing to review calls that
23 they've made and see if they're correct. I've heard
24 endless criticism that our channels are filled with
25 nothing but text and endless repeats of programming

1 essentially turning off viewers. But just like
2 broadcast TV and cable networks, the school year, which
3 is our broadcast season, runs from September to June.
4 When school lets out in June we run a summer program
5 schedule on 18 that includes programming from across the
6 previous school year, plus requested programming and
7 school board meetings until our first regular season
8 production come August and early September. And
9 frankly, I've seen episodes of NCIS repeated endlessly
10 on cable channels and that doesn't affect viewership,
11 does it.

12 It's also ironic to point out that one of the
13 initial forays of the Internet over cable was the direct
14 result of working with the Roseville Schools as we
15 developed the iNET as the early backbone for our
16 district wide area network some years ago. This was a
17 proof of concept for concept's current Internet access
18 servers, yet the proposal to take back the iNET and in
19 essence have users pay twice for a system that's already
20 been paid for is insulting.

21 To wrap up my comments, I just want to reiterate
22 the impact CTV and Public Access television has had on
23 this area in the Roseville community in general. We
24 have touched and continue to touch the lives of
25 countless students and their parents and community

1 members and we work to show all the great things that
2 happen in our communities through our communities. It
3 has been and continues to be my great pleasure to work
4 with the set of CTV and the young people in our
5 communities to cover these events for our community.
6 This has been my life the last 30 years and I urge you
7 to remember that when you go back to your individual
8 city councils and not allow Comcast to silence our
9 community voices or deny our access to this Public
10 Access medium. I ask you to please vote no in their
11 proposal. Thank you.

12 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Mr. Powers. Next
13 we'll hear from Moon Kim who is from Shoreview.

14 MOON KIM: Thank you very much for this
15 opportunity. My name is Moon Kim and I live at 1549
16 Lois Lane in Shoreview. I'd like to speak up about the
17 importance of CTV from three different perspectives, one
18 from education. I earned my Ph.D. in education and
19 administration so I know how important this CTV is for
20 ten years. And also I serve on the Mounds View
21 district, the advisory committee for several years. And
22 when you see the students who are motivated by the
23 training given by the staff, you don't know how they are
24 helping. And so I want you to know that. And also
25 because CTV has excellent programming and they have the

1 type of programming, even they have a handicap person
2 who would go to the Metrodome and find out why, what
3 kind of handicap he has and all the fellow handicap
4 persons.

5 So CTV 15 meets a wide, community wide needs,
6 not only just as subscribers. And I'm a member of the
7 Minnesota Korean Veterans. I host the appreciation
8 picnic for the Korean veterans. And the volunteers from
9 CTV came with the truck. And I want you to come and to
10 see how hard that they are working and how happy the
11 Korean War veterans are. And so we are going to have
12 another picnic this year and we have a two-hour for
13 programming. Let me ask you, where can we have this
14 two-hour programming without interruption. And then we
15 have a very, very many problems throughout the two-hour
16 program.

17 And about, about the eight PEG channels, and
18 that's very, very important to reflect the needs of the
19 community needs. And I want to ask you, I read this
20 report several times and this year I have found Comcast
21 raise so many objections for your demand of what to use
22 and the data. For example, these objections are in
23 Pages 29, 32, 36, 37, 42, 44, 47, 60, 62. And then so
24 are you going to let them to go their own way without
25 asking what you need to find out what is the best thing

1 in this community.

2 And then the other thing, they compare, the ABC,
3 local ABC broadcast with the CTV and, and they did not
4 recognize ABC, the broadcast ABC TV is a commercial.
5 And when you think of the weather and the sports, how
6 much time do they have to discuss, to cover in depth the
7 topics. CTV has time and the support to give excellent
8 in depth coverage.

9 So I would like you to support the current
10 financing, currently kept their support because that's
11 what you need and what we need. And to please think
12 that you are the leader of this intense city area, just
13 not for the subscribers, but entire population of this
14 greater ten cities. And I am very proud to live in
15 Shoreview. And please consider that CTV is an asset.
16 We have excellent education, we have CTV which would
17 give young people motivation and also all the people
18 that they find something to do. So I want you to deny
19 the application. Thank you.

20 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Mr. Kim. Next we'd
21 like to hear from Craig Allen who is from Little Canada.

22 CRAIG ALLEN: My name is Craig Allen, our
23 family has lived in Little Canada for 16 years. My
24 purpose here is to tell you how important CTV is to our
25 family. We first got involved with CTV in 2006 when my

1 son Ethan Allen took a video production class in eighth
2 grade at Roseville Area Middle School. That class was
3 taught by CTV volunteer Wayne Powers.

4 Ethan liked the class so much that he started
5 volunteering for CTV. At first it was just set up and
6 tear down the location shots, but soon thereafter he was
7 taught how to work a camera and given real
8 responsibility in filming everything from sports to
9 concerts, parades and many community events. CTV also
10 gave informal classroom training, advanced camera
11 operation, editing, directing and producing television
12 shows.

13 After high school Ethan enrolled at Century
14 College, but continued to volunteer hundreds of hours at
15 CTV. In fact, by this time Ethan had more practical
16 video production and broadcast experience than any other
17 student in the communications department.

18 In 2013 Ethan was given the opportunity to
19 direct and produce a two-hour band concert filmed at
20 Central Park in Roseville. It was a proud moment for
21 all of us. After graduating with a two-year degree,
22 Ethan transferred to St. Cloud State University to
23 pursue a B.A. in mass communications with an emphasis in
24 television production. He will be a junior next fall
25 and he is using the CTV scholarship money to help pay

1 his tuition. None of this would have been possible had
2 it not been for the training he received at CTV.
3 Because of CTV my son has found has passion and his
4 career.

5 My daughter is a sophomore at Roseville High
6 School. While she has done some shoots for CTV, her
7 passion is music. We love the fact that we can see
8 rebroadcasts of her band and choir concerts. I can't
9 imagine a community without CTV. You must make sure
10 that this great community resource is not only funded,
11 but given the resources to produce high quality digital
12 programs. I think my family and all of our communities
13 are worth it. Thank you.

14 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Mr. Allen. Next
15 we'd like like to hear from Sallee Dawson from Falcon
16 Heights.

17 SALLEE DAWSON: Falcon Heights, yes. My
18 name is Sallee Dawson, I'm at 1864 Simpson in Falcon
19 Heights. I'm not here to beg for the continuation of
20 CTV because I've not had much opportunity to even see
21 much of it.

22 In July of 2013 I called Comcast to get the PEG
23 channels. A technician came out, installed some things
24 so I got some channels, and said it was, I thought it
25 was supposed to be free, was told that it was, just the

1 PEG channels. And then I started getting, I got a bill
2 for 62, 60 some dollars that was for the installation.
3 So I paid that. Then I started getting monthly bills
4 from Comcast. I didn't unfortunately record all of
5 those in the beginning. But we went back and forth, I
6 kept explaining, I got other channels but I said I don't
7 want those, all I want is the PEG channels. They didn't
8 seem to know what it was all about. And then my TV went
9 blank, had nothing.

10 So in the meantime I called them, went back and
11 forth, but I got some letters from Comcast. Just to
12 give an example of the confusion I've gotten that I seem
13 to think they have in their customer service, the first
14 letter says, sorry, I got to find the first one.
15 October 16th, as part of our franchise obligation to
16 your area we provide a complimentary access to the
17 universal PEG consisting of your Public Educational
18 Government, it goes on. Comcast will start encrypting
19 limited basic service on your cable system which
20 includes the PEG channels, therefore, you will be able
21 to view these channels. And it says prepare for the
22 upgrade simply and gives definitions.

23 Then I got a letter that said our records
24 indicate you recently downgraded your Xfinity service,
25 as a result of the downgrade you have equipment that you

1 must return to us. Back and forth for quite a while on
2 the service. In the meantime I kept getting bills.

3 I ended up going after I think I counted 32
4 phone calls back and forth with their customer service
5 and their billing which do not communicate, they were
6 told I had to call them separately. But I contacted, I
7 went to the local Xfinity outlet and Chris there put a,
8 zeroed out my bill, showed it to me on his screen how he
9 had zeroed it out and I explained everything. Now I
10 have repeatedly been getting a bill, I have no service
11 now but I keep getting a bill for \$200. It just cannot
12 quite explain what I've been through with the customer
13 service. So I have no TV, no PEG TV, and a \$200 bill.

14 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Ms. Dawson. Okay.
15 Next we're going to hear from a group from Roseville,
16 the Roseville Adult Learning Center. I think we have
17 two representatives, Jackie Gambaiani and Tim O'Brien.
18 Tim, you're going to be the spokesperson?

19 TIM O'BRIEN: Yeah, I'll be the
20 spokesperson.

21 MR. BEILKE: Perfect.

22 TIM O'BRIEN: Good evening. My name is Tim
23 O'Brien and I'm the manager at the Roseville Adult
24 Learning Center, which is Roseville's adult basic
25 education program. My address is in St. Paul.

1 I'm here representing 40 students and teachers
2 who have benefitted from our relationship with CTV.
3 Comcast is a corporation that's been granted a monopoly
4 on public wire ways in the spirit of public utilities,
5 in the spirit of a public good. As part of this
6 relationship that of a public good the service area
7 that, in this service area CTV provides Public Access.

8 I'm here to speak in support of the current
9 funding for CTV. We are a school of students from all
10 over the world. This year we chose to train one of our
11 English language learning classes and academic group
12 that is working towards a high school diploma. We are
13 hoping to leverage this training to build their ability
14 to capture their learning and skills in multimedias.

15 One of the projects we worked on this year was
16 to record our culture fair for Public Access. It was a
17 proud moment for all of those students. It was a
18 beautiful event and if you haven't seen it I would
19 recommend it. This is one of those programs that's
20 repeated on Public Access cable television.

21 I wanted to read just a couple of letters
22 quickly from the students. CTV means a lot to me, it's
23 very important to me, to our students. Our students
24 were very lucky to have this program and to learn and
25 practice on the big cameras. The studio was such a nice

1 place and helped our students a lot. I learned a lot of
2 things in the studio. Right now I know how to set up a
3 camera, how to shoot people in the show. What a
4 wonderful thing to have. I'm so excited and I very much
5 like it. Please don't shut down the program because it
6 provides such a great life changing experience for
7 everyone involved.

8 The second letter. It is my first time learning
9 about professional use of cameras. I am so nervous. I
10 have, I'm afraid, I'm shy to stand in front of the big
11 camera. I never had a dream to learn about how to use
12 this professional camera. Now I know many things about
13 these cameras. I love it. While I was shooting our
14 school culture fair I feel like I am so proud of myself
15 standing in front of the audience, moving the big
16 camera, shooting the show. I'm so happy and excited.
17 Also while I watched the movie I shot my heart was
18 jumping too much. Oh, so excited and fully happy. I
19 want to learn more about this and thankful of all the
20 teachers and the work that supports this program. I
21 really enjoyed it. I will enjoy it more hopefully.

22 To cut the funding for this program by
23 80 percent as proposed is a direct attack on the Public
24 Access as an obligation to this community and I am here
25 to talk about that value. Thank you.

1 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Mr. O'Brien. Next
2 we'd like to hear from Randy Gustafson who lives in
3 Falcon Heights. Welcome, Randy.

4 RANDY GUSTAFSON: Thank you, Commission
5 members. My name is Randy Gustafson, I live at 1775 St.
6 Mary's in Falcon Heights for the past 30 plus years. I
7 don't envy what you're having to do here and how it's
8 going about. But I do want to say that I think
9 programming has a great value and the community
10 television does as well as we have seen here.

11 The commercial interests do not control it, very
12 important when you're trying to get government data and
13 information to the people who want to see it. Citizens
14 have the right to know what is going on in their
15 government and what they're doing. The city council
16 meetings that, that are boringly run over and over or
17 the planning commission meetings that I posted and I've
18 heard people, I don't know why I'm nervous. But anyway,
19 the, I've been surprised by the number of people who
20 will come up to me afterwards in the community to say I
21 saw you doing this and you did that and what's the
22 purpose, you know. And it's quite engaging and there's
23 a real value to that for the people who can't get there,
24 who can't attend the meeting but can see it and can
25 watch it and can get the feedback to know what's going

1 on.

2 The challenge I suppose for the North Suburban
3 Cable Commission is that there are ten cities that you
4 have to respond to. You don't have the value of say
5 St. Paul with its one, one city, one franchise, 300,000
6 people and two bucks a month to provide programming for.
7 We have a little bit greater expectation than that. And
8 it's, it's reflective by that way with our three school
9 districts. All of that we do need to fund those efforts
10 and do that. I know that the cable customer is the one
11 that's paying and that's kind of how it works, but I
12 think that Comcast and the cable commission would be
13 better served if we can make use of those strategic
14 resources that are available to improve the programming
15 and to foster greater community involvement. Thank you
16 very much.

17 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Mr. Gustafson.
18 Next we'd like to hear from Mike Robertson on behalf of
19 the City of North Oaks.

20 MIKE ROBERTSON: Mr. Chair, Commission, I'm
21 Michael Robertson, city manager of North Oaks and I only
22 need three minutes. North Oaks is the fifth community
23 that I've been city manager of. It is the first
24 community where I have not been allowed to have a direct
25 number to the local person who does the maintenance on

1 the system. And that's what I'm asking for here. I
2 promise you I won't abuse it, but I'll tell you a story
3 of why it's needed.

4 About two weeks ago I had a person return who
5 had been out of the country for three and a half months.
6 Lucky guy, he skipped most of this winter. In that time
7 the movement of snow by the snowplow had hit his cable
8 box which is in his front yard and wrecked it. So he
9 not only had no cable, he had no land line. He was also
10 dealing with a leaking water pipe, so he had a lot of
11 things going on, so we said we will call for you.

12 My administrative assistant spent over
13 20 minutes on the phone. She was talking to someone who
14 she had to explain what a snowplow was. She had to keep
15 explaining that this cable box was in the front yard,
16 not in their building. I suspect she was from a culture
17 where there were no front yards, and that someone who
18 didn't need to be there when the maintenance person
19 came.

20 What I'm asking you, can I give you my card, can
21 I just get the number of the person to call who doesn't
22 need to be explained what a snowplow is or what a front
23 yard is. That's all I'm asking. I promise I won't
24 abuse it. Thank you.

25 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Mr. Robertson.

1 Next we'd like to hear from Lynn Redlinger who is from
2 New Brighton.

3 LYNN REDLINGER: Hello, I'm Lynn Redlinger,
4 I live at 3006 Brookshire Lane in New Brighton. And CTV
5 has been a place where I have volunteered for the past
6 20 years. In addition to working with other producers
7 on the shoots, I regularly produce two shows. And
8 through these shows I strive to bring the people, places
9 and events in the community to the viewers of Channel
10 15. Over the last 15 plus years that I've done the
11 show, I have featured local people, their businesses,
12 their passions and their talents.

13 For example, just over the past couple of years
14 on the Tale of Ten Cities we've told the story of local
15 businesses such as Lindey's, Flaherty's and Sweet
16 Chocolat. We've featured people with talents as
17 artists, writers, musicians, actors and quilters. For
18 family fun we took a look at the Ramsey County fair,
19 archery and the Tumble Fun Bus. In an effort to keep
20 the residents apprised of assets that are available in
21 the area we did segments on the Salvation Army, free
22 food at the Peace Garden in Lauderdale, the door-to-door
23 senior food delivery program and Next Door as a way to
24 keep neighbors connected in Roseville. And we've met
25 local residents who are curlers, guitar makers, spinners

1 and pickleball players. The list just goes on.

2 The other show I do is a monthly show called New
3 Brighton Now that highlights what's happening in the
4 City of New Brighton, promoting community spirit and
5 community pride by letting residents know about events,
6 people in government and resources in their city is my
7 goal for the show. The parks and recreation department
8 has a regular monthly segment on the show and sees it as
9 a way to promote the recreational opportunities that are
10 available for all ages in the city.

11 Other segments include things such as community
12 coat give away, food shelf, bundles of love and the
13 youth organization committee partners with the youth. I
14 get to visit on the show with people such as Marina Kunz
15 who as a high school student started a free summer food
16 program and Michelle and Carol Vanz who are honored for
17 their work with the Be the Match program. And I'm also
18 proud to say that New Brighton Now has a spinoff series.
19 I used to interview a lot of police officers and
20 firefighters until the Department of Public Safety said
21 hey, this is a great way to get the message out to the
22 community, so they now have their own show called Public
23 Safety Spotlight which we tape right after New Brighton
24 Now.

25 The stories that we tell are not necessarily the

1 ones you'll hear on the bigger TV stations, but they're
2 our stories and they help to build pride in the
3 communities. So let's not lose the resource that allows
4 us to produce shows that bring the community to the
5 community. Please support community in the media.

6 MS. HAAKE: You can tell Lynn does TV work
7 because she got herself right in there with one second
8 left.

9 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Ms. Redlinger.
10 Next we'd like to hear from Alane Matko of Shoreview.
11 And I believe she's intending to speak on behalf of the
12 Irondale High School robotics team and brought company.

13 LOGAN MILDENBERGER: Good evening and thank
14 you for listening to us. I'd like to start out by, with
15 my name. I'm Logan Mildenberger and I'm with the
16 robotics team that operates in Irondale High School.
17 I'd like to start off with what CTV does in broadcasting
18 wise for the robotics team.

19 There are two regionals that run congruently
20 locally at the University of Minnesota. CTV broadcasts
21 both of those regionals live on the Channel 15
22 programming. Also, the Minnesota State High School
23 league championship for robotics also is broadcast live
24 through CTV. And we greatly appreciate that because
25 that acknowledges that robotics is an activity that is

1 comparable to any other sport like football or baseball,
2 you have that problem where we're not usually looked at
3 as a sport.

4 But also I want to give merit to the NASA live
5 feed which right now sure it's the International Space
6 Station, but in a week it's going to be FIRST
7 championships which in St. Louis that's where our team
8 is going next week. It, the NASA live stream will be
9 streaming four events all composed of a hundred teams
10 each. So there are 400 total FIRST robotics teams that
11 are competing at world championships from all over the
12 world and that is what the NASA live stream streams and
13 that is what comes across CTV on that channel.

14 And now Alane is going to talk more about how
15 CTV helps our team personally.

16 ALANE MATKO: Thank you, Logan. I'm Alane
17 Matko, I live in Shoreview. I am a five-year mentor of
18 the Irondale High School robotics team. This is our
19 first year to work with CTV and use its facilities.

20 CTV has provided the team training,
21 certification and the use of its equipment to create
22 videos for FIRST. If you are unaware what FIRST is, it
23 is the acronym For Inspiration & Recognition of Science
24 and Technology. It is a nonprofit, so is our team, so
25 we have to do our own funding.

1 With the use of the CTV equipment we were able
2 to submit for FIRST awards our chairman's video, which
3 the chairman's video shows how we give back to the
4 community. And this is judged, of the 400 teams
5 worldwide compete for this one award, as well as the
6 many media, technology and innovation awards sponsored
7 by Comcast that will be awarded at FIRST championships.

8 We will be, as Logan said, at championship next
9 week hoping that we will be named media innovation award
10 winners so we have another trophy to bring home. If you
11 would like to view us, you can watch us on the access
12 station next week as well as follow us on our new Web
13 site that was just launched at www.team2052.com. Thank
14 you for your time.

15 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, both. Just a
16 comment for those of you standing in the back, we do
17 have some chairs in the front if you'd like to sit, so.
18 Now I need a little help with the next speaker, I'm not
19 sure I can read the first name. Last name is Cable,
20 first name could be Dom or Don or Doug.

21 DON CABLE: Don.

22 MR. BEILKE: Don. Thank you, Don.

23 DON CABLE: Hi. I'm Don Cable, I've lived
24 in New Brighton for about 40 years. About 30 years ago
25 I was with a company called Reese Targo TV, I was

1 general manager. And we went to a meeting on the strip,
2 I think it was at the Radisson, and we talked about
3 cable first coming into this area. And the one thing
4 they told us is because we were paying for the
5 programming, there would be no commercials. Now that's
6 not true today. We get all kinds of commercials and
7 we're still paying for it. But we were told there would
8 be no commercials. The only stations that would have
9 any commercials were like WGN which is out of Chicago
10 because they're a public station already. But then your
11 premium stations of course they talked about HBO and
12 Showtime were the only two premium stations back in
13 those days.

14 Fast forward to 40 years. I decided to go with
15 Comcast. I had a salesman come out to my home and they
16 had a couple of different packages I could go with at
17 the time. And the one package was just the TV, the
18 second package is they wanted me to take their phone
19 service, and the third package was you had to sign a
20 two-year contract with them. The salesman told me you
21 don't want to have a contract with Comcast, he said take
22 the TV and the phone only, so that's what I did.

23 For the first three months everything was great.
24 After three months I started having phone problems. The
25 phones would go out anywhere from an hour to all day

1 long. I run three, I own and operate three construction
2 companies out of my home. If my phones don't work, I'm
3 out of business. So after about six months of horsing
4 around with Comcast, I did call one day and asked to
5 talk to a supervisor. A guy got on the phone with me
6 and he said look, we know we're having problems, we're
7 working very hard to correct the problems, he said
8 within a week everything should be up and running.

9 Two weeks later I called and I was still having
10 problems. I got ahold of a different supervisor and he
11 said I don't know what's wrong, he said it must be you
12 because we we're not having any problems. So I quit
13 Comcast and went back to Direct TV. At that point they
14 took my, they said I owed them \$455. They wouldn't tell
15 me why I owed it to them, they just said I owed them
16 \$455. They sent the bill to seven different collection
17 agencies. My, my credit score went from 820 down to
18 749.

19 A year ago I tried to buy a new car. And I went
20 in and did all the paperwork and stuff and the salesman,
21 the loan manager there, I went into his office and he
22 says I don't know if I can get you done, he says how
23 come you got seven different accounts that have gone to
24 collection. And I said they're not and I explained what
25 happened. And so he called the bank because I had my

1 last loan there and they approved it and I got the car
2 loan no problem. But if they can do this to me, they
3 can do it to anybody in this community. And I think
4 they're a greedy company and they don't care about any
5 person, their feelings, their credit rating, anything,
6 it's just bring money in. So I'm in favor of getting
7 rid of Comcast and getting somebody else in here.
8 That's it.

9 MR. BEILKE: Thank you.

10 DON CABLE: And my name is Don Cable.

11 MR. BEILKE: We believe it. Next I'd like
12 to hear from Ora Mae Mitchell who is from Roseville.

13 ORA MAE MITCHELL: Good evening. My name
14 is Ora Mae Mitchell, I'm a 35-year resident of Roseville
15 and also a volunteer for CTV. I volunteer for the North
16 Suburban Beat. It's a program that gathers information
17 from all of the ten North Suburban areas and lets
18 everybody know what is going on in each of your
19 communities. And prior to being the anchor I had no
20 idea about what even went on in Falcon Heights, let
21 alone North Oaks. And since being the anchor I have
22 come to appreciate the ability to connect with other
23 communities that are neighbors to know what's going on,
24 to find out what they value, to have them appreciate
25 what's going on in our community as well. I don't think

1 this would happen if we didn't have CTV. And I am proud
2 as a retiree to spend my time providing this
3 information.

4 And my only question is why don't we have more
5 money given to this enterprise rather than less. And
6 also, the whole business about repeating programming.
7 Now I'm a news junky and I watch CNN and MSNBC and any
8 other news program. The news is repeated a hundred
9 times a day. The only thing that changes is the anchor.
10 So I don't think that is a valid argument whatsoever.
11 Thank you.

12 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Ms. Mitchell. Now
13 we'd like to hear from Moe Nozari who is from North
14 Oaks.

15 MOE NOZARI: My name is Moe Nozari, I live
16 in North Oaks. Steve and I have worked together in the
17 past in some other capacities. I think the counsel from
18 Comcast made a rather compelling presentation in terms
19 of differential of the cost that we expect here versus
20 let's say Woodbury. And always budget is an issue. But
21 I have a suggestion on how to solve that. Like the lady
22 before me, I watch the news frequently and I see so many
23 ads from Comcast for Comcast that they should use and
24 everyone should use Comcast Internet service because
25 it's so much faster than DSL and this and that. That is

1 the point that when I see that ad coming up I change the
2 channel. So maybe Comcast should cut back on their
3 advertising of their brand and take a half of it and
4 spend it on things like this.

5 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Mr. Nozari. Let's
6 see. Next we would like to hear from Brian Brady who is
7 from St. Anthony.

8 BRIAN BRADY: Thank you. My name is Brian
9 Brady and I've lived in St. Anthony for about 22,
10 23 years now. Given the advanced hour I'll try and
11 focus on a couple of topics which I haven't seen covered
12 perhaps as deeply as they might be.

13 One interesting thing I did discover searching
14 for background information is a recent award. In
15 April of 2014 Comcast was awarded the 2014 worst company
16 in America award, an annual contest by the Consumer
17 Affairs blog, the consumers that run a series of readers
18 polls to determine the least popular company in America.
19 And this was the second time Comcast had won that award
20 in the last five years. Hearing some of my fellow
21 residents speak, this is not a surprising outcome.
22 Certainly Mr. Cable would agree with that I believe.

23 One of the other things I noticed learned
24 counsel for Comcast was quite concerned about 3 or \$4 a
25 customer. My understanding, the next planned Comcast

1 rate increase will be for \$5. And I don't remember how
2 big the last one was, but it seems like most of us when
3 we look at our bills over the last ten years since
4 Comcast, well, longer than ten years, they seem to have
5 gone up by a lot more than a few dollars and they seem
6 to do that quite regularly. So to suggest that we're
7 doing a great service to our communities by trying to
8 save a dollar or two and giving up a critical community
9 resource in the process just does not seem like a
10 sensible idea.

11 Prior to Comcast purchase, our system had 12
12 full quality channels for local programming. Now as
13 they've gone digital and subdivided and split and
14 divided, we're already down to much less than that and
15 they're trying to cut that down to even a lower level.
16 And to suggest that the other cable channels don't
17 repeat frequently, that's foolishness. You just look at
18 the listings on the system and you say no, there's a lot
19 of repeats on cable. So it doesn't seem like a
20 reasonable issue to talk about.

21 The other point I would want to make mention of,
22 learned counsel suggested that Congress had made some
23 decisions. Looking at the public's report for 2013,
24 Comcast and their trade associations were the fifth and
25 seventh largest lobbying entities in the United States.

1 Between them they spent over \$38 million to make sure
2 that Comcast tweaked the rules in their favor. And they
3 seemed to have made some success if we were to believe
4 the things that learned counsel said. Thank you.

5 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Mr. Brady. Next
6 we'd like to hear from Chuck Whitergren from Shoreview.
7 That must be Chuck. Good evening.

8 CHUCK WHITERGREN: Good evening. Hi, I'm
9 Chuck Whitergren, I'm the IT manager for Ramsey County
10 Library. I'm losing my voice here. I wanted to talk
11 tonight a little bit about the iNET because I think
12 there's not a full understanding how it's used. And the
13 iNET has been vital in supporting the library's
14 technology initiatives by providing access and reducing
15 costs. In fact, the library's case is saving us tens of
16 thousands of dollars a year, if not more.

17 The library utilizes the iNET to provide high
18 speed connections between its four facilities in the
19 NSCC service area, that's Shoreview, New Brighton,
20 Mounds View and Roseville. And I don't think a lot of
21 people know that. So when you go to the library, you're
22 on the iNET, so you're saving some money there.

23 These interconnections have allowed
24 consolidation of technology required to support our
25 daily business. But more importantly it's provided

1 faster and reliable access to collections, applications,
2 programming and Internet. All important things.

3 I started throwing together some statistics just
4 so you realize who uses the library and how important it
5 can be. The Ramsey County Library has 92,293 registered
6 library users that are residents of the ten city area.
7 And if you look at that, that's approximately 41 percent
8 of the population of suburban Ramsey County. So you
9 have a pretty significant population that are registered
10 users that use the library.

11 The Ramsey County Library maintains 326
12 computers and they were used 322,444 hours in 2013.
13 That's the equivalent if you sat down at a computer for
14 37 years, 24 hours a day. So our use is really high in
15 the libraries. And 68 percent of those computers are
16 located in the facilities in your service area.

17 Also, wireless use is really high. 251,000 plus
18 sessions in 2013, that's 75 percent of all our wireless
19 users in this area. It's interesting, last June when
20 the storms went through and the power went out, people
21 flocked to the library. Our wireless access went up a
22 hundred percent. So, you know, they look to us for
23 resources.

24 Getting to digital literacy classes. We
25 produced 323 digital literacy classes that were attended

1 by over 2,300 students in 2013. And our digital
2 literacy programming, some is sponsored by Comcast
3 Internet Essentials program and classes include Internet
4 basics and Microsoft Word. And this programming really
5 helps persons that can't afford their own computers,
6 Internet access, or just haven't had a chance to be
7 exposed to technology. So it's really a nice outreach.

8 We also just completed a survey through the Edge
9 Program. And this is a nationally recognized program
10 supported by the International City & County Management
11 Association and the Gates Foundation and ALA, American
12 Library Association. And the people that took the
13 survey, 95 percent of the participants felt it was
14 really important that libraries, or the community
15 maintain public access technology in libraries. So we
16 have, you know, a good following, our users are really
17 wanting the technology.

18 And cable access channels have played an
19 important role in promoting our general programming.
20 Events that have been covered include author talks,
21 election coverage, summer reading programs. And in
22 particular CTV has been sponsoring a video boot camp
23 that's been allowing teens to be certified to use the
24 professional technology that's available through CTV.
25 And that's been going on I think three years at CTV.

1 And actually five years over at SAC.

2 And in just the programming that we promote, in
3 2013 to give you an idea, we had over 2,500 library
4 programs with over 78,000 participants. You know, loss
5 of the iNET and the PEG funding is going to impact
6 library services, most likely requiring pretty expensive
7 alternatives to maintain quality of service.

8 I just want to close by saying the library and
9 its users owe a good deal of thanks to the NSCC for
10 their support for iNET access to the library. I just
11 wanted to get those statistics out there so people
12 understood what the iNET was. Thanks.

13 MR. BEILKE: All right. Next we'd like to
14 hear from Amy O'Connell who is from Roseville.

15 AMY O'CONNELL: First I'd like to start
16 with some basic high school algebra. Oh, challenging
17 stuff. Ten cities divided by \$7, \$7, ten cities, that's
18 \$0.70. All right. So I, I'm Amy O'Connell, I live in
19 Roseville. I am 16 years old and I am a youth producer
20 at CTV. I have done several programs there including my
21 most famous one, Evolution of Gaming. And I'm going to
22 tell you a story. This story is about Tony and his
23 participation in the Evolution of Gaming. So anyways, I
24 made this thing, it's the Evolution of Gaming. It's
25 about our video gaming community here in Roseville. And

1 it was very cool and we interviewed this guy, his name
2 is Tony, and he was the manager of this place called
3 Games & Go. And after this video debuted on the CTV
4 channel, now this was a short video, okay, it was like
5 five minutes, people came in droves to Games & Go and
6 they were like it's Tony. Like seriously, like I went
7 to Games & Go once and there was this little
8 four-year-old looking at games and he pointed at Tony
9 and he said that's the guy from the video. It's amazing
10 what CTV has done for local business owners, but it's
11 especially amazing what CTV has done for people like me.

12 Now I was, I joined CTV after doing a library
13 program. And what happened was like one year in
14 basically they were offering jobs at CTV. So I never
15 filled out a job application before, I didn't know, I
16 was like 14. And this girl Rachel, she's the, she was
17 the youth media coordinator like a year ago, she brought
18 in this person and she taught me how to fill out a
19 resume. That was huge. I had never touched a resume, I
20 was like 14. And then I got interviewed. And it was, I
21 don't know his name, I should know his name, I got
22 interviewed by this guy, okay, he was an old guy. And
23 he looked me in the face and he asked me a bunch of
24 intimidating questions like job interviewers usually do
25 and I was like. Obviously I didn't get the job, but

1 when I tried again next year I was prepared. CTV has
2 prepared me for the job world. I vote no.

3 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Ms. O'Connell.
4 Next we'll hear from I think it's Jon Paul O'Connell,
5 also from Roseville.

6 JON PAUL O'CONNELL: My name is Jon Paul
7 O'Connell and I live at 1361 Skillman in Roseville.
8 This is my daughter Amy and I'm very proud of her. Amy,
9 my wife is community oriented and, and said to Amy, hey,
10 there's this television production class, do you want to
11 take it. And she said sure, you know. So she went to
12 CTV and she learned about television and production.
13 And it was kind of cool to me because shamefully I
14 probably watch the most TV in the room, so. And then
15 she started producing TV and her show. They interviewed
16 me about how back in the '70s and '80s I used to put a
17 quarter in a Pac-Man machine and, you know, and then
18 before you know it I was on TV and it was great. And
19 but before you know it again, Amy was getting a job in
20 the summer teaching other people to do what she had just
21 learned, and it wasn't even that long ago that she
22 learned it.

23 And it's true about this guy, his, his revenue
24 increased at this Rosedale Mall Games & Go because, you
25 know, people saw him on TV and they liked, they liked

1 his personality and they bought games from him.

2 I was a Comcast person from St. Paul and
3 St. Paul had crummy value as a Comcast thing. They did
4 have the NASA channel and they had this Associated Press
5 feed which all it did was tell the news as it was given
6 over the wire. And they, they pulled both of those
7 channels and I didn't like that. And then I came to
8 Roseville when I got married and I was a Comcast person.
9 And they would have a deal where it was 72 and sunny and
10 my cable went out. And I didn't like that very much
11 either. So I, I gave my money to Direct TV because I
12 liked that better. And I think the raising of the rate
13 would be their biggest fear that people who don't care
14 about the cable access will go to another provider
15 because other providers would provide just as well or
16 better.

17 But I think you guys should reconcile and meet
18 somewhere in the middle because I wouldn't want to lose
19 this service as its been told to me would be cut so
20 much. But then again, if they lose their money too,
21 wouldn't it hurt everybody. So I don't know. We, we
22 hired you guys to figure this out for us, so do your
23 best. Thank you.

24 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Mr. O'Connell. Now
25 we'd like to hear from George Wellock who is from North

1 Oaks.

2 GEORGE WELLOCK: Good evening. My name is
3 George Wellock, I'm from North Oaks. I've been a
4 resident here since the early '90s. I have been not
5 only a viewer of CTV, but I've also been a volunteer and
6 a producer. And I've had the great pleasure of actually
7 learning an extraordinary amount from, from the system,
8 from the team at CTV in terms of teaching skills. I
9 think this is one of the major things that a community
10 service like CTV does for this, for this area. They
11 teach, they build skills and so forth.

12 My involvement with them started with when as my
13 daughter was at Mounds View. And as many of the prior
14 folks have mentioned, there's a lot of places where
15 community TV touches the community and, and provides
16 exposure to, to activities and, and events that you
17 wouldn't see if you didn't have a service like this.

18 I have worked with the Mounds View dance team,
19 with the band, with the orchestra. I have done a great
20 deal of, of shooting, of producing and putting
21 information onto, onto the community, onto CTV, onto
22 Channel 15 and so forth.

23 And we as parents for many of these activities
24 that go on in the school found a great deal of support
25 from CTV. Not only did we get taught skills, but we

1 provide all of the equipment and, and the facilities
2 that really helped us to allow our, our children and,
3 and the schools to actually have a great deal more
4 exposure and have the community see much more about
5 what's going on there.

6 There was a comment made about how repetitive
7 the, the taping, or the shows were. The repetitive,
8 I've actually had feedback from people asking me when
9 are these on. And I'm happy that they're on at multiple
10 times because everybody can't see it at the same time.
11 So we've had good feedback coming back about the way
12 that the program is actually produced and sent to the
13 community.

14 I want to just, I have very little time left so
15 I just want to stand here in support of the important
16 service and infrastructure that this provides, that CTV
17 provides to this community. And I just want to let you
18 know that it's one of the reasons that we moved here
19 23 years ago is to be in a community that has this kind
20 of community spirit and, and provides the kind of
21 services that are provided here. I support the
22 continuation of the CTV.

23 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Mr. Wellock. Okay.
24 Next we'd like to hear from Mark Hughes of Shoreview.

25 MARK HUGHES: I'd just alert the cable

1 commission that Jo Erbes is going to step up here in a
2 minute and do this as a joint venture. My name is Mark
3 Hughes, I'm a resident of the City of Shoreview. We've
4 been producing Disability Viewpoints it will be 16 years
5 October 1st. In that time we've revamped the whole show
6 within the last year. We've brought on five new
7 co-producers, we've been Minnesota's longest running
8 disability issue show with help of the Minnesota Channel
9 and, and TPT.

10 One of the stories that I'll tell you very
11 briefly is we once had a volunteer named Megan Brown
12 who, who came to us with very little or no broadcast
13 experience, went on to be an intern at WCCO TV, which
14 I'm very proud of, then moved to the Alexandria market
15 to become a 10:00 news anchor, which I'd like to do and
16 haven't done, but she got to do it anyway. And we've
17 also won seven national awards, we've been No. 1 in the
18 professional category across the country which meant we
19 were No. 1 in the country.

20 I'm not going to stand up here and tell you I
21 did that all by myself or how good I am or I'm not. It
22 takes a lot of people, it takes a village to do this.

23 But in my final comment before we ask Jo Erbes
24 to stand up here, Mr. Tietjen from Comcast, if you
25 would, are you still in the room? Please stand up. I

1 want something understood right now. You spoke earlier
2 about the cable commission. You sat here and, and gave
3 us the, your facts, is that true? And but I've heard
4 when the representative went over to the studio it
5 didn't really look at our facility. And I want to take
6 this opportunity to invite you next Monday night at 7:00
7 when we go on the air with Disability Viewpoints live,
8 I'd like to have you sit in the studio as my guest and
9 I'll stick around and answer any questions you have. I
10 want you to see firsthand what we do over there, I think
11 it's only fair. Would you accept my invitation?

12 MR. TIETJEN: What day?

13 MARK HUGHES: Monday.

14 MR. TIETJEN: Monday of next week, sure.

15 MARK HUGHES: Okay. I'll see you at, if
16 you want to come at 6:30 I'll answer questions
17 beforehand or I'll stay after. I think it's only fair.
18 Because I think what was said about the cable
19 commission, you have to have the facts before you
20 understand the real story. Thank you. Jo Erbes is
21 next.

22 JOANN ERBES: As Mark said, I'm Jo Erbes,
23 I'm co-producer for Disability Viewpoints, a cable
24 television show out of CTV 15 that's been operating for
25 16 years with Mark as the cohost. And as he said, we

1 have received seven national awards for our show. Our
2 show airs on Metro Cable Channel 6 repeatedly. We are
3 one of the shows in the rotation at CTV and very, very
4 proud of that fact because the audience that we reach,
5 the senior citizens and people with disabilities watch
6 TV at all different times of the night and day because
7 they can't sleep.

8 In addition to that, we have a Facebook page.
9 And on our Facebook page we link to the archived shows
10 through CTV's Web site which people really, really enjoy
11 being able to see statewide. And as Mark said, our show
12 is rebroadcast for the last three years on Minnesota's
13 channel TPT, the Minnesota Public Television channel.
14 We hear from a lot of people locally, statewide,
15 regionally about the importance of the shows that we
16 produce through Disability Viewpoints.

17 To highlight some of our shows, we have talked
18 about technology and how it can improve the lives of
19 people with disabilities at home, at work, and in
20 school. Some of our cohosts have talked about what it
21 has been like growing up and living with a disability in
22 our society and in our schools. And recently we've had
23 legislation passed on the bullying of schools, or in
24 schools. And the majority of those students are
25 students with disabilities who are bullied because they

1 are different and because they learn differently.

2 We've provided information to the public about
3 access to healthcare across the life span for people
4 with disabilities from birth to death. We have
5 celebrated the awards that people have received for
6 using assisted technology, for young girls ages seven to
7 14 who have competed in pageants for people with
8 disabilities, and we've celebrated the anniversaries of
9 the Americans with Disabilities Act. We even recognize
10 the achievement of a young comedian from Minnesota who
11 won the Last Comic Standing, Mr. Josh Blue has appeared
12 on our show.

13 As a gentleman earlier talked about, we have
14 highlighted the accessibility of Minnesota landmarks,
15 the Mall of America and the new Minnesota Twins Stadium
16 to show people how easy it is for people with
17 disabilities to navigate these Minnesota landmarks. We
18 really, really, really encourage you to continue to
19 support CTV and their efforts to bring this programming
20 to the communities of your ten cities, to the metro area
21 and statewide. Thank you.

22 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Ms. Erbes. Okay.
23 Next we'd like to hear from Luann Quayle who's from
24 Roseville.

25 LUANN QUAYLE: Hi, I'm Luann Quayle, 1851

1 Ryan Avenue, Roseville. I urge you not to be fooled by
2 word play. Counsel for Comcast cites all of their
3 things are a proposal. However, the NS 50 items are all
4 demands and I urge you to think carefully about the
5 choice of wording there.

6 I used to fit into the usage survey category of
7 that person who rarely viewed the PEG channels.
8 However, as I grew to be a community member of
9 Roseville, became a Girl Scout leader, a Cub Scout den
10 leader, an active volunteer of Roseville Schools, and
11 the parent of two children in Roseville Schools, that
12 changed. I now depend on, enjoy and regularly view
13 those channels as do scores of my friends and fellow
14 parents.

15 What makes a community strong is the very fabric
16 of a community and those are its people. Those people
17 are woven together to be a great tapestry. This channel
18 and all those channels serve and enrich that tapestry
19 and make it great. Please do not rend that very fabric.
20 Thank you.

21 MR. BEILKE: Okay. Next we'd like to hear
22 from Everett LaBuda who is a CTV volunteer.

23 EVERETT LABUDA: Thank you. My name is
24 Everett LaBuda, I'm from St. Paul. And if I knew I was
25 going to be last, I wouldn't have gotten here at 6:00.

1 Not that it makes any difference.

2 About the fabric, I am part of the fabric of CTV
3 15, I have been for, I don't know, a number of years
4 now. Moon Kim is my good friend. I remember when he
5 called me and said well, we can't do the show, it's off
6 because we didn't get a truck. Because that was the
7 first year I was here and I wasn't truck certified and
8 there was nobody else available. I thought for a minute
9 and, and I thought well, you know, I'm getting out of
10 something here. But I knew his commitment, I knew his
11 heart, and I said, well, you know, Moon, we can still do
12 it. He said how is that. I said well, we'll get three
13 camcorders and shoot it. I'll shoot one and do the
14 cutaway, I'm good at that, and I am. And Norm Goode
15 will shoot with one and Lynn Redlinger will shoot the
16 third, or actually the first because she's the most
17 qualified. And that's how Moon got his start. So I am
18 part of the fabric. Now I'd like to, I got to get
19 something.

20 A couple other things about that fabric. You
21 are destined for a career in television. She has
22 already appeared on shows like Laugh-In, that's quite a
23 ways back, and the Carol Burnett Show, maybe Carol
24 Burnett herself. And she's got that kind of talent.

25 Also one of the people attempting to shoot

1 Moon's show was Ethan Allen, he was spoken about.
2 That's a kid I've really loved and encouraged him as
3 much as I could because he's really got a lot on the
4 ball. Yeah, really. And tell him, give him a high-five
5 from Everett LaBuda.

6 Okay. I just got started, can you give me a
7 little extra time. One sentence from a newspaper
8 article gives me a thought. I got to find it. On
9 August 4th a group of young people who had gathered to
10 watch a fight near Pebble Street and Minnehaha Avenue in
11 St. Paul apparently set upon an innocent bystander Ray
12 Winstrand, 26, and beat him nearly to death. That's the
13 kind of thing that I do stories on, and it has to do
14 with racial tension in this country. And it should be
15 done. It can only be done on cable access. The big
16 channels don't do anything like that because it takes
17 too much time, too much effort, and they don't want to
18 spend the money. The only place you're going to see
19 that show is on cable network. And that's something to
20 consider. You don't want to take that away, that
21 possibility. Ray Winstrand, by the way, is the master
22 controller over at White Bear. I'm not sure he's going
23 to be able to do his work again, but here's how I'd do
24 the show just to show you what kind of thing I would do.

25 We'd start on him and have him tell about that

1 night, how it happened. He was walking home west on
2 Minnehaha Avenue and he saw a disturbance on Pebble
3 which juts into Minnehaha. And girls were fighting, two
4 girls. That was the main attraction at that time as he
5 came upon it. And one of them went down. And Ray went
6 to her assistance. When I have him tell all, that is
7 what he would tell what happened to the girl. He can
8 only tell you when he started to reach down and help her
9 up, that's when he was hit by something in a sock. And
10 it, it caused a severe injury to his head, brain
11 swelling. There wasn't much of a chance that he'd ever
12 get full control back of the things he had to do as a
13 master controller.

14 And then I would cut to the girl he helped and
15 ask her to describe what she saw when Ray was trying to
16 help her up. And then I would ask her to describe what
17 she saw lying in the street there. Ray Winstrand almost
18 naked, bleeding profusely, unconscious. And then I
19 would cut back to Ray and then we'd get out of that part
20 and go what caused this. And it was really a black
21 violent surge of rage, where is that coming from.

22 Thank you. I got one minute. And it comes, I
23 would show one clip from a movie I saw when I was 11 or
24 12 called The Smugglers. And this is a shot through a
25 spy glass where they're showing a ship bringing slaves

1 to the United States of America. And as the ship could
2 overtake them, they wanted just in their cargo just
3 hundreds of black people who were going to be slaves.
4 So they dump all the slaves into the ocean all at once
5 chained together. And that is the source of black rage.
6 That's what you will see. And at least we'll introduce
7 that as a possibility and what I really believe and try
8 to instill in people and see it as the show. Before we
9 ever really get to deal with the black, we've got to do
10 something with that insanity. Thank you very much.

11 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Mr. LaBuda. Next
12 we're going to hear from some representatives of the
13 Womens Initiative for Self Empowerment, I believe it's
14 Mysee Chang and Jenna Ernst. Welcome.

15 JENNA ERNST: All right. Good evening. My
16 name is Jenna Ernst and my colleague Mysee and I are
17 here representing the Womens Initiative for Self
18 Empowerment, or WISE. We are, our office is in
19 St. Paul, but the young women that we serve are included
20 in eight of the 12 zip codes that we serve, eight of
21 which are up there, so we're speaking on their behalf.
22 CTV has been one of our strongest partners and we're
23 here tonight to share a little snippet of how they have
24 enhanced our programming as well as strengthened and
25 supported our mission.

1 All right. Our partnership with CTV began last
2 June when CTV came to teach participants in our Girls
3 Getting Ahead in Leadership program about videography.
4 The theme for the summer was identity exploration
5 through art. CTV staff worked closely with our youth to
6 teach them 21st century technology skills. Most of our
7 students are from refugee camps and some of them have
8 never held pencils. So videography was a very big leap
9 for them. CTV helped their GGAL participants to use the
10 skills that they needed to produce a documentary about
11 the struggles immigrant high school students face.
12 Through this project our participants were finally able
13 to find an outlet to tell their stories previously
14 unheard, stories of refugee horrors, stories of
15 challenges overcome, and stories of dreams realized.

16 There is so much more to be said about CTV.
17 Each one of our students has their own personal story.
18 But in summary, CTV has immensely helped Womens
19 Initiative for Self Empowerment to further its mission
20 of empowering immigrants and refugee women and girls to
21 succeed. At WISE our hope is that the young women we
22 serve have the opportunity to develop their voice, speak
23 up for their community, which is also everyone else's
24 here, and become positive forces of social change.
25 CTV's partnership with WISE has allowed us to do that

1 and so much more.

2 MYSEE CHANG: Good evening. My name is
3 Mysee Chang, and I'm actually a resident of Mounds View.
4 I'm here today to represent one of our GGAL leaders, her
5 name is Midan Ling. She submitted a letter and I'm
6 reading it on her behalf. Hello, everyone. My name is
7 Midan Ling and I'm a leader in GGAL. I want to share
8 with you today how CTV has helped to empower me and my
9 parents. I came to this country in 2010 with my family
10 from a refugee camp in Thailand. As a new immigrant to
11 Minnesota I knew little English and felt so shy to share
12 my ideas. There are many times when I felt lost, afraid
13 and unwelcomed. Some people at school make fun of me
14 because I don't speak good English. I was afraid until
15 I found GGAL. Through GGAL I feel I've become the
16 leader I want to be. The project I worked with CTV last
17 summer in June played an instrumental role in my
18 leadership development. For the first time I could show
19 the world my life. Whenever it was my turn to use the
20 camera I felt so excited. For the first time I could
21 say what I wanted to say through a video. When I saw my
22 video on the CTV Web site I felt so proud of myself.

23 This year CTV conducted GGAL again and inspired
24 me to keep telling my story. Right now my team and I
25 are working on a video titled, "How to move forward, the

1 struggles of immigrant and refugee high school
2 students." After we finish this video our plan is to
3 show it to our high school and to the community so that
4 people will better understand our situation and reach
5 out to us and support us. Our hope is that we can show
6 immigrant students like us that yes, it's hard, but we
7 can make it.

8 I want to say more, but I'd like to just end my
9 letter by thanking Alex and Jordan who are staff members
10 of CTV North Suburbs. Alex and Jordan, I really want to
11 thank you because you two believed in me and showed me
12 that my story is important. Every day I hear something
13 negative about immigrants, but because of you two I
14 don't believe those negative comments. Instead I'm
15 determined to contrast those negative stories with my
16 own powerful story. Thank you and I encourage you to
17 support community media and CTV North Suburbs. Thank
18 you.

19 MR. BEILKE: Okay. Next we'll hear from
20 another CTV volunteer, Carla Beaurline.

21 CARLA BEAURLINE: Beaurline, yes. I grew
22 up in this area. I was a resident of Mounds View for
23 24 years, even though I currently live in Chaska, but I
24 volunteer for CTV. When I first found out about the
25 cable franchise renewal proposal, my first thought is,

1 you know, why don't they understand the value. And then
2 as a business owner of course I know the bottom line is
3 cost. But also they don't have an attachment to our ten
4 north suburban cities like someone like myself who grew
5 up in this area.

6 I'm the perfect story though of why, and I'm
7 only one of numerous people and I'm not, I'm certainly
8 not the most successful of interns in former employees
9 to come out of CTV. I grew up in Mounds View, New
10 Brighton and graduated from Irondale in 1986. I went on
11 to Augsburg College and I graduated with a
12 communications degree focused on broadcast journalism
13 and also a sociology degree graduating with honors in
14 broadcast journalism school.

15 Upon graduating I saw an ad for an access center
16 that was just forming in 1991, it was CTV North Suburb.
17 I was hired as an intern and then as a part-time
18 employee and then went into full-time employee. And I
19 actually worked in master control, but I took the job
20 even though I wanted to be an on air talent because it
21 gave me experience in all areas of production, which you
22 do not get anywhere else that you do an internship in,
23 in any of the networks here in town. I was then hired
24 as a full-time employee. And since April of 1991 CTV
25 North Suburbs under the leadership of Cora Wilson has

1 grown and thrived. And the reason is not only because
2 she's a smart woman, she understands this industry and
3 the value it brings to the ten north suburban cities.

4 The quality and the level of production speaks
5 for itself in all the awards they win. However, most
6 people don't even refer to CTV as an access center. As
7 a result of this leadership, okay, I'll hurry, and
8 quality production. After leaving CTV I became a home
9 shopping host for Shop NBC. Comcast owns part of NBC as
10 we all know. I made millions of dollars as one of their
11 top salespeople in giving back on the return of the
12 investment because of the tools and skills I learned
13 from CTV.

14 As a result, I left there in 2004, opened my own
15 media company and TV show that now has aired 11 years on
16 Comcast. We're now in production for our 159th show,
17 it's aired over 11,000 times, and I have given back a
18 return on my investment from the skills I learned at
19 CTV. My show alone has given them over a half a million
20 dollars. In addition of course I have Comcast TV, the
21 phone and Internet, and we won't even talk about the
22 issues I have with that not working, that's a whole what
23 I would say bottle of wine story. But as a result
24 obviously I have given them millions of dollars and
25 that's because of the return on the investment that I

1 made. Can I just finish. Okay.

2 I understand it's not Comcast's job or even your
3 job or priority or goal to invest in people like me, I
4 understand that. Or bigger names that have come out of
5 CTV that are in LA, like Conor Holt or even David
6 Berggren who works for NBC who came out of here at KARE
7 11. But I, I have given back as have many of these
8 people in so many unique ways. You are investing in us
9 in an education.

10 It's imperative that we continue to be a voice
11 for all of these ten communities to invest in our future
12 which is our children. My parents moved to Mounds View
13 because of the educational, the school system. I keep
14 coming back to volunteer because of what you've given
15 me. You've allowed me to be a successful entrepreneur
16 of over 20 years with the tools I've learned. I have
17 learned in my almost 46, almost 47 years your best
18 investment is your education. So I ask that you please
19 vote no so that more, as you know there are many kids
20 like myself who have grown and come out of here, so that
21 more people have that opportunity. Thank you.

22 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Carla. Next we'd
23 like to hear from Nikki Villarencio.

24 NIKKI VILLARENCIO: Hi, good evening.
25 Thank you, Commission, for, for hearing me tonight. I

1 am one of the, the co-producers, or cohosts of
2 Disability Viewpoints. And it is such a great value to
3 me, to my family and to the community that I call the
4 disability community. I am a leader in the disability
5 community and I'd like to think of myself as a leader in
6 my community in general. I, I look forward to cohosting
7 Disability Viewpoints every chance I get because it
8 gives me a voice to talk about the things like everybody
9 else has talked about that you cannot see on regular
10 television.

11 One of the most proudest episodes that I was
12 able to cohost is I did a program on parenting with a
13 disability. And I am a mother of a two-year-old
14 daughter, and so I was able to interview two other
15 mothers with disabilities and it was just a great show.
16 And it was, it was, it was a very proud moment for me
17 because I was able to talk about issues that you cannot
18 even hear about or read about hardly in, especially in,
19 in the Twin Cities area. You just don't, there's not a
20 lot of information about that.

21 So the value that Disability Viewpoints and CTV
22 gives to the larger group of the disability community
23 is, is, you can't even measure it. Because we speak
24 about legislative issues, we speak about everything from
25 the things that seniors deal with and people with

1 disabilities, young and old. And so I would just like
2 you guys to vote no. And the funding that CTV and
3 Disability Viewpoints gives to the community is
4 extremely important to me and my family. Thank you.

5 MR. BEILKE: Thank you. Let's see. Next
6 we'd like to hear from Tim Benjamin of St. Paul. Is Tim
7 not with us? Maybe not. Okay. We'll move on, we can
8 come back later. Let's see. We have another CTV
9 volunteer, it's William Wasserm from Minneapolis.

10 WILLIAM WASSERM: First off I'd like to say
11 thank you for letting everyone speak to the council and
12 everybody in the room for coming.

13 MR. BEILKE: William, you should give your
14 name and address for the record.

15 WILLIAM WASSERM: William Wasserm, I live
16 in Minneapolis, 1916 West 60th Street. I've been doing
17 television for close to 30 years. I started with a
18 company called Titan Sports. Larry Morsette and I
19 started, we go back a long ways, we started together a
20 long time ago.

21 Anyhow, to get directly to the point. I've
22 listened to what everybody has to say and it's been a
23 wonderful amount of information, some of it quite
24 heartbreaking actually. And I hope that you take this
25 all to heart. It would be a very huge loss for

1 everybody here, for all the different communities, so
2 forth. My, at my age of 60 I would survive, but a lot
3 of these youths would not, a lot of these people who
4 really depend on it would not, all the youths coming up
5 that really benefit from this would not. That's what's
6 important. What you people decide to do is extremely
7 important.

8 More important than all of that are those people
9 standing out in the hall that depend on these jobs.
10 That is extremely important, the life, the families that
11 depend on this. Not just the volunteers. The
12 volunteers are extremely, extremely, extremely
13 important, please don't get me wrong, but those people
14 that need those jobs, that's what's important.

15 I've been through the times with Michelle Glynn,
16 I was there. Mark Hodgkiss, you all know who I mean.
17 Those are, those are the people that got hurt. I just
18 want to thank you all and hope you do the right thing.
19 Thank you very much.

20 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, William. Next we'd
21 like to hear from Al Beheary.

22 AL BEHEARY: Good evening, ladies and
23 gentlemen of the council, and Mr. Chair. My name is Al
24 Beheary. Almed Al Beheary, that's my full name. I live
25 in Columbia Heights, I don't live here in one of your

1 cities. But I have taken classes with CTV and I have
2 volunteered there and they understand the value. So I
3 came here especially when I heard about this hearing to
4 make sure that I state, I state my \$0.02 and make sure
5 that the word has gotten out that not just the people
6 who live in these cities have benefitted from CTV, but
7 people outside these cities have benefitted from CTV.
8 So when I hear the fact that every city is responsible
9 for itself, every city has to buy its own equipment, I
10 would say that's untrue. That's not the American way,
11 that's not the Minnesotan way, that's not what I have
12 seen here in my 12 years here in the Twin Cities.

13 I have been, I come here as an immigrant, as an
14 Egyptian American. I came here 12 years ago and here's
15 what I have seen. I have seen people stand for one
16 another. And this is your chance as council members to
17 stand today for these people. It's land of the free and
18 home of the brave, right. So here's what I'm going to
19 say, be brave enough because the power is in your hands,
20 it's not in Comcast's hands. It doesn't matter if they
21 spent on their advertising 469 millions in the second
22 quarter of 2012 on advertising, no. The power is in
23 your hands. When the stadium was being built I saw
24 another injustice just like this. And they didn't want
25 women and minorities then in the capacity we were asking

1 for. We went, we fought and we got the legislature
2 involved, we got the governor involved, we went to the
3 governor's office, and guess what, we got the
4 percentages that we needed.

5 I hear the counselor saying that this is a
6 matter of law, he stands, he stood here and he said that
7 in order to make sure that he rattles you. He said it's
8 a matter of law so nobody could contest it. Here's what
9 I'm here to say. Having \$2 million in reserves for a
10 business that operates on the millions a year, or
11 operates, sorry, at \$13 million over the course of ten
12 years, this is nothing. We're talking about 6 percent
13 of reserves, that's nothing. We, we have to make sure
14 that that business continues. And have, in order to
15 have that business continue you have to have those
16 reserves. If he says it's a matter of law you can't
17 spend the money, guess what I call that, bullying. He's
18 trying to bully you into using the funds in the way he
19 sees fit through the loopholes of the law. And I'm here
20 to say that we have legislatures on our side, we have
21 law makers on our side, and guess what, if each and
22 every one of you including the leadership here go up to
23 the legislatures and tell them that we are here to stay
24 and access TV and CTV has to stay, they will listen and
25 Comcast will kneel. Thank you very much for your help.

1 Have a good day.

2 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Mr. Beheary. Next
3 we have another CTV volunteer from Columbia Heights.
4 I'm going to mess this name so bad, I'm sorry. Siobhan
5 Kierans. Sorry.

6 SIOBHAN KIERANS: That's okay. I even
7 wrote it phonetically for you.

8 MR. BEILKE: You did.

9 SIOBHAN KIERANS: It's usually my last name
10 people have a problem with. My name is Siobhan Kierans
11 and I'm from 3850 Polk Street Northeast in Columbia
12 Heights, Minnesota. I got involved with CTV when I came
13 here from Ireland just a wee bit over 20 years ago and
14 it was my first, one of my first real employers here in
15 Minnesota.

16 Well, nobody ever taught me how to wear a pager
17 like the technical guys at CTV, and I'm not kidding you,
18 that's way back in the '90s. But this law firm here is
19 really a very impressive law firm I have to tell you.
20 They fought against big tobacco and they won. And now
21 they're representing Comcast. What they're fighting
22 against now is moms and dads and kids and Boy Scouts,
23 Girl Scouts, non-profits, minorities, underserved,
24 seniors, individuals just like you and me. So, you
25 know, I just got to let you know that it's a very big

1 law firm that these guys have.

2 So they say though that people don't watch, you
3 know, Public Access or community media. People really
4 don't know what they watch. I worked in television for
5 a very long time and if you took a poll here of
6 everybody in the room and say well, what do you read,
7 you'd probably say well, I read the Wall Street Journal
8 or I read New York Times or maybe if you're checking
9 your stock prices. But the reality is that you're
10 probably looking at the Roseville Review or the Heights
11 Happenings or the Victoria Secret catalog that comes
12 through the mail. But there's a lot of things that you
13 probably wouldn't think of that you're reading the same
14 way a lot of people don't realize that they're actually
15 watching Public Access.

16 You know, but who actually does watch community
17 media. Well, again, it's the moms and dads, it's the
18 seniors who are sitting around in an old folks home
19 watching one television more than likely who built this
20 community. And, you know, I work in financial services
21 now and I know that we're all not far away from that.
22 And I'll tell you, it's coming faster than you might
23 think. So when you're thinking about what does it mean
24 to us right now, it's what is it going to mean to us in
25 ten years from now, 20 years from now, 30 years from

1 now, because that's what the ramifications of what this
2 conversation is going to be.

3 You know, I don't have children, but I happily
4 pay my taxes so that other people's kids can go to
5 school. The same way that if people need money to put
6 cameras in Lauderdale, I don't have a problem with that.
7 And I think it's very judgmental for somebody to come in
8 and tell me that I would have a problem with that.

9 The idea is that I live now in Columbia Heights
10 where there is no Public Access and my Comcast bill did
11 not go down. And I'll tell you too that it's a big hole
12 in the programming because we have no idea what's going
13 on in the community, we really don't. We've lost our
14 sense of community and it's going away a little bit at a
15 time. We took away, you know, Wal-Mart came in and they
16 took the big, big huge industries and now they're taking
17 away the little minority and small business owners, the
18 sole proprietors, and this is what we're doing to our
19 media. And the thing with media, if you have media that
20 has like one way of showing you what they want to show
21 you, nobody will be able to stand up and have an
22 individualized thought because there's going to be no
23 diversity in your programming. You're going to be
24 watching repeats of infomercials, The Golden Girls,
25 NCIS. And I can guarantee you people like who are the

1 role models in our society, like Wayne Powers, John
2 Osterhaus, I mean, seriously, Carla Beaurline, Jo Erbes,
3 seriously there's a lot of really important people here
4 today who are role models not just for me but it
5 increases ten-fold.

6 So one thing I want to leave you with is a
7 little thing, being Irish I always like to say something
8 a little bit Irish, so I would say don't lose your
9 community to Wall Street scrutiny. Thank you.

10 MR. BEILKE: Thank you. Next we'd like to
11 hear from another CTV volunteer, Eric Bollenson.
12 There's Eric.

13 ERIC BOLLENSON: I don't have any greatly
14 prepared comments. I'm an engineer, I work for a big
15 company and I get it, you know, Comcast is a big
16 company, big law firm, they want to try and squash this.
17 And just like the previous speaker says, you know, you
18 lose your community, you lose all this, you lose the
19 ability to reach out and, and, and contact people and do
20 the things that this, this station does.

21 And the last thing I want to say is some
22 80 percent, it was mentioned about 80 percent people
23 don't watch access or don't want to pay extra for
24 access. I believe if you surveyed Minnesotans you'd
25 find out that 80 percent of them don't want to be paying

1 for all these stadiums and all that kind of stuff
2 either, but it gets railroaded through by big companies.
3 So thank you.

4 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Eric. Let's see.
5 Another CTV, Lauri Flaquer, CTV volunteer, Lauri.

6 LAURI FLAQUER: Hi, I'm Lauri Flaquer,
7 Solutions, and I'm also the host of Focus Forward. And
8 I just want to ask one quick question. Can I ask, where
9 can you turn on the TV and not see sex, not see
10 violence, not see anything angry. It's bliss. We
11 educate, we inform. I, I produce six shows at CTV and
12 every single one of those shows is educational, pure and
13 simple. Not only that, it's not just our community, we
14 can't just think it's this community, it isn't. I speak
15 to best selling authors, to world famous people all over
16 the world, in Dubai, in Great Britain, in South America,
17 in Mexico, all over, all over. And I bring their
18 viewpoints and their ideas and the things that have made
19 them famous to this community. And I think that that's
20 very important.

21 And I, the reason why I think it's so important
22 is because we don't get that, we don't get that at
23 3:00 in the morning, at 5:00 in the morning. I am so
24 happy when I see my shows rebroadcast. I don't think
25 they're rebroadcast enough. Personally, I think the

1 whole channel should be mine and I could be able to
2 provide everything that I want. The youth, the
3 immigrants, the senior citizens, everybody needs to see
4 what we're broadcasting. Not only that, the reason I
5 know that is because I have a background in television
6 for more than 25 years at CNBC. CNBC today is 25 years
7 old. I was there then, I was there. CNBC, NBC, ABC,
8 Bloomberg, all over. And I, believe it or not, was a
9 makeup artist. And I have worked on some of the most
10 famous people in the world. And the most important job
11 I have is at CTV bringing broadcasting that no one else
12 would be doing. Comcast isn't going to do that, huh-un,
13 no how, no way. But I want to bring to this community
14 things that they could not get on their own. And I do
15 it. I bring Spanish programming, relationship
16 programming. I now have a show The Real Deal in Real
17 Estate, and I invite you all to watch it. And that show
18 is fabulous. It teaches people how to buy real estate,
19 how to invest in real estate. And nobody gets paid to
20 do it. We do it because we want to improve the
21 community, and this is a way. I beg you to vote no and
22 keep us going. Thank you.

23 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Lauri. Let's see.
24 Next Kenneth, is it Gammell from Minneapolis. Is Ken
25 here? He's not here. Okay. That is my second time

1 through the list. I know you're just one person who
2 isn't here. Is there anybody else?

3 DARYL POLZIN: You missed me.

4 MR. BEILKE: I'm sorry?

5 DARYL POLZIN: You missed me.

6 MR. BEILKE: I did. How did I do that?

7 DARYL POLZIN: Because I don't live in your
8 community.

9 MR. BEILKE: You're welcome to speak. Just
10 name and address for the record, please.

11 DARYL POLZIN: My name is Daryl Polzin. My
12 address is 1844 East Shore Drive in the City of
13 Maplewood, Minnesota. And I really didn't know what I
14 was going to say when I got up here. I was just, I'm
15 the other half of that lovely lady in the wheelchair who
16 said she has a two-year-old-daughter. That's also my
17 daughter.

18 There is times when Nikki produces shows for
19 Disability Viewpoints or she is sitting and doing cable
20 commission stuff that she does for the City of
21 Maplewood, she's a park and rec commissioner, and there
22 are times when Allie and I are home alone and she wants
23 to see her mom. Her mom is very busy. So what do I do,
24 I have the opportunity to either click on the Internet,
25 get the shows through CTV's Web site, or I can click and

1 periodically I might see the show rebroadcast on Metro
2 Channel 6.

3 The reason why I was saying all this is because
4 prior to our involvement with CTV and our involvement
5 with Disability Viewpoints I produced a, a show years
6 ago called Disability Awareness Day. That show, that
7 show was produced and I was primarily out of St. Paul
8 cable network or the network, okay. That show ran
9 approximately six to seven years. Up until seven years
10 ago I would still see shows that I have produced years
11 ago, probably even 20 years ago. And so I was flattered
12 by that because I looked a lot better than I had, a lot
13 longer hair and I, I was a little younger then.

14 But it is extremely important for CTV and cable
15 access shows like, like Disability Viewpoints or like
16 the other ones that were mentioned here today to stay on
17 the air. And it is your job as the, as the council to
18 make sure that that happens.

19 When I heard, when I heard the counselor say
20 that he was looking to reduce the channels from eight to
21 four channels, I thought to myself, oh, crap, what does
22 that mean. That means even though that Disability
23 Viewpoints vies into an hour slot maybe once a month or
24 twice a month to broadcast on Metro Channel 6, that
25 means it might possibly go away. So that means the work

1 that my wife and I do in the disability community, which
2 I've done and I've been recognized nationally for, that
3 means I won't be able to get our messages out to the
4 people that would much rather stay at home or can't even
5 get out into the community like a lot of people who are
6 elderly or severely disabled.

7 And I just urge you guys to vote no and think
8 very strongly about what Comcast is proposing to do
9 because the devil is in the details. Because if I'm
10 disabled and I don't make a lot of money but I'm willing
11 to pay a little bit more to make sure that those eight
12 channels stay around, I'm sure there's other folks just
13 in my position or in similar positions that would pay a
14 little bit more for those eight channels to be there.
15 So I urge you to vote no against Comcast's agreement and
16 force them to come to the table and come back with a
17 more appropriate proposal. Thank you.

18 MR. BEILKE: Thank you. Okay. Anyone else
19 wishing to speak during public comment?

20 JOANN ERBES: Mr. Chair, if you haven't
21 heard enough from Disability Viewpoints, I have two
22 more.

23 MR. BEILKE: Okay. I didn't see your name
24 on the list of sign-ups again, so please.

25 JOANN ERBES: I was. I'm Joann Erbes, I do

1 live in Apple Valley, I volunteer with Disability
2 Viewpoints and have for 11 of their 15, 16 years on the
3 air. As Mark Hughes told you, we have five new cohosts
4 and they are very, very passionate about the work that
5 they do on Disability Viewpoints and unfortunately two
6 of them couldn't be here today, but I have testimony
7 they would like me to read.

8 MR. BEILKE: Okay.

9 JOANN ERBES: The first one comes from
10 Nicholas Wilke. And Nicholas grew up in St. Paul and I
11 believe he lives in Minneapolis at this time. Nicholas
12 is also an individual with a disability. And he says
13 good evening community, colleagues and community. My
14 name is Nicholas Wilke and I am writing to you today to
15 share my experience with you in support of CTV Roseville
16 and its awesome programming.

17 My first experience with CTV was over 12 years
18 ago when I first was asked to be a guest on Disability
19 Viewpoints. Even back then I was struck by the need to
20 share and be more aware of stations like CTV, what kinds
21 of stories were being told, and how did those stories
22 provide opportunity and make a difference in the
23 community life.

24 Here in the present I am happy to tell you that
25 I have had countless number of experiences as a guest of

1 Mark Hughes. Each of those shows has been amazing.
2 Over a year ago I began cohosting segments of Disability
3 Viewpoints. This has pushed my passion to the next
4 level. In its capacity I have worked on material and
5 guests for three segments. All of these shows has been
6 the kind of television I believe viewers want to see
7 more of. The staff of the station and our program staff
8 pour themselves into this work. Please allow us to
9 continue this passion for our community and for our
10 viewers. My best, Nicholas Wilke.

11 Nick is going to be one of our cohosts this
12 coming Monday when we tape our show. Tomorrow Nick and
13 our co-producer Ken Gammell are going to be taping his
14 show. Nick is going to be shown as an individual with
15 disabilities, his experiences in purchasing, getting a
16 license and driving a three-wheel motorcycle. So when
17 we begin airing in the first of May, I really encourage
18 you to watch our show. Can I have a couple minutes to
19 read the next one?

20 MR. BEILKE: Yes.

21 JOANN ERBES: Thank you. The next one
22 comes from a mother who is Bridget Siljander. She and
23 her daughter live in Wayzata, her daughter is a
24 sophomore in the Wayzata School District. Bridget is
25 the executive director of the Youth Legacy Foundation.

1 Disability Viewpoints is a community treasure.
2 For those of us who have been part of the show as
3 guests, volunteers and in audience, we are keenly aware
4 of the necessity of this platform for discussing
5 disability topics and issues. My daughter is the teen
6 cohost. She is 16 years old with cerebral palsy who is
7 an honor student and community leader. She has
8 interviewed youth with disabilities on the show,
9 highlighted their accomplishments and their aspirations.

10 This show has given a face and a voice to the
11 youth with disabilities who have limited opportunities
12 to showcase their talents and their contributions. The
13 disability community needs this unique forum which has
14 established itself as a credible program over its many
15 years of serving the community. During this time it has
16 won national awards and recognition.

17 I am deeply concerned that defunding CTV would
18 adversely affect and damage this important show and
19 other shows on the station. People with disabilities
20 are already marginalized and isolated and Disability
21 Viewpoints helps break down community barriers that
22 prevent people with disabilities from living a full,
23 meaningful life in the community with everyone else.

24 We cannot afford to lose Disability Viewpoints
25 because it is too valuable and has benefitted the

1 community tremendously. We need to protect our assets
2 like this show which improve lives through promoting
3 awareness of issues that are often hidden. Thank you
4 for considering my testimony and I urge you to support
5 continuing this program so it may do more good, add more
6 enrichment, inspire more hope, and encourage greater
7 equality against our wonderful communities. Thank you
8 for this opportunity.

9 MR. BEILKE: Thank you. Okay. Anybody
10 else?

11 WILLIAM WASSERM: Can I interject one thing
12 in less than one minute?

13 MR. BEILKE: Yes, go ahead. William,
14 right?

15 WILLIAM WASSERM: Yes, sir. What I have to
16 interject will break all the barriers, but it may help
17 offset all the costs, but it will change access as we
18 know it with commercials, meaning that if you sell a
19 commercial, and everybody will have to be in agreeance,
20 you don't get the money. It goes to equipment, to fund
21 whatever needs to be funded. We run the commercials on
22 our shows. That's how it works. If anybody starts to
23 bitch, it stops. Food for thought.

24 MR. BEILKE: Okay. Thank you. So for
25 everyone else, I think we're going to close the public

1 comment portion of the meeting. But I will remind you
2 and will mention this again at the end of the meeting
3 that the record from this public hearing is going to
4 remain open until the first of May. And so if folks do
5 have a thought or know someone who could not be here
6 tonight, they could submit those comments in writing to
7 the Commission's office or to the email address we will
8 give later on. So there is still an opportunity to make
9 your voice heard.

10 Now moving along in our agenda, we want to give
11 Comcast an opportunity to respond to the public comment
12 session. So, Mr. Tietjen, if you would, please.

13 MR. TIETJEN: Thank you very much. I
14 appreciate the opportunity to speak again. Now as I, as
15 I had said earlier, the cost for CTV falls into two
16 categories, capital funding and operational funding.
17 And Comcast's proposal nearly doubles the capital
18 funding that CTV has needed. And it would provide all
19 of the capital funding that the individual cities say
20 that they need.

21 Now the 5 percent franchise fee that customers
22 pay is supposed to provide the operational support for
23 CTV. It is wonderful to hear all of the strong,
24 emotional, enthusiastic support for Public Access
25 television, for CTV. Comcast shares that. But for all

1 of those people who believe in that programming, and
2 Comcast is one of them, you must ask where is the money
3 for your franchise fee, 5 percent of your bill every
4 month being used. Because the cities agreed long ago
5 that that 5 percent franchise fee would be used only for
6 cable related expenses. But only a fraction of it is.
7 So what Comcast is proposing among other things is
8 simply what the cities themselves agreed to years ago,
9 that all of that franchise fee be used for cable related
10 expenses to support that great program that we hear so
11 much support for tonight. Thank you.

12 MR. BEILKE: Thank you, Mr. Tietjen. So
13 that is the end of our public hearing. So what I'd like
14 now is to ask for a motion to continue this public
15 hearing until our next scheduled meeting on May the 1st
16 starting at 7:00.

17 MS. BAUMAN: I make a motion.

18 MR. BEILKE: Any second?

19 MR. GRAY: Second.

20 MR. BEILKE: All in favor of the motion say
21 aye.

22 ALL RESPOND: Aye.

23 MR. BEILKE: Opposed?

24 MR. ROE: Mr. Chair.

25 MR. BEILKE: Yes, Dan.

1 MR. ROE: I would request that we provide
2 an opportunity or an explanation for the folks who are
3 paying attention either on TV or in the audience tonight
4 as to what the next steps are, what happens at the
5 May 1st meeting, we have a subsequent meeting after that
6 and what happens after that so people understand what's
7 coming up in the process.

8 MR. BEILKE: Sure. So are you asking us to
9 do it now?

10 MR. ROE: Yes, or before we finish this
11 meeting.

12 MR. BEILKE: There's one thing I need to do
13 before we get to that which is to officially comment
14 that this hearing is continued until May 1st, 2014.
15 Anyone who does want to submit comments like I said
16 before either in writing, via email, can do that on or
17 before that date by sending them to the Commission's
18 offices at 2670 Arthur Street in Roseville, or sending
19 them by email to speakup@CTV15.org.

20 MS. WILSON: Mr. Chair, I think you need to
21 take a vote on the motion.

22 MR. BEILKE: We did.

23 MS. WILSON: Oh, did you. I'm sorry, I
24 missed that.

25 MR. BEILKE: It was approved. Now as far

1 as the suggestion from Commissioner Roe that we give a
2 little outline of steps to come, is that something that
3 staff or counsel wish to do.

4 MS. WILSON: The two of us together. At
5 the, what we contemplate is at the May 1st meeting we
6 will close the hearing and incorporate all the written
7 comments that we've received up to this point and
8 through May 1st into that, into the record. The staff
9 and consultants will be completing our response and
10 reports on the formal proposal from Comcast and those
11 will be presented to the Commission for its review. The
12 Commission will then likely on I think it's May 15th is
13 what we're looking at at this point, we'll vote on a
14 resolution to recommend to the cities to either accept
15 the proposal from Comcast or to preliminarily deny the
16 proposal from Comcast.

17 So then it goes to the cities. There will be
18 votes at each of the city councils on that resolution
19 and on the proposal. Once that is done we'll tally up
20 that. And as has been mentioned earlier in your earlier
21 comments, if the cities preliminarily deny, Comcast is
22 still entitled to another public hearing in front of an
23 administrative law judge, and that would be the next
24 step.

25 MR. BEILKE: Okay. Is that good enough,

1 Dan?

2 MR. ROE: Thank you.

3 MR. BEILKE: Okay. Thanks. Steve, do you
4 have a comment?

5 MR. GAZZETTA: Just to say, there will be a
6 finder of facts who will adopt conclusions, findings of
7 fact and conclusions of law, it probably, may be an
8 administrative law judge or we may decide to go a
9 different route. I would just state that that's yet to
10 be determined because we haven't gotten to the point yet
11 of the cities making a decision to approve Comcast's
12 proposal or preliminarily deny. And I think I suspect
13 and just to clarify, I think at the May 1st meeting is
14 when the special meeting on the 15th will be set at
15 which the Commission will adopt the resolution
16 recommending either approval or preliminary denial.

17 And I want to stress again as Ms. Wilson said,
18 it's just a preliminary decision. Comcast will have,
19 you know, a hearing that protects its due process rights
20 to the extent required by law which it will be required
21 to put on evidence. And based on the record of that
22 hearing that is when a final recommendation will be made
23 to the member cities and a final decision will be made
24 as to whether or not to renew or deny Comcast's
25 franchise. So there is a way yet to go. You know,

1 Comcast's rights will be fully protected to the extent
2 consistent with applicable law. And again, there is
3 just a lot that remains to be done at this point.

4 MS. WILSON: And just one final comment.
5 As Mr. Tietjen mentioned, most franchise renewals are
6 concluded informally and we will continue to have
7 informal conversations with the company and we will
8 continue to do that as they are willing to. And so our
9 hope is that we can still resolve this on an informal
10 basis.

11 MR. BEILKE: Okay. Thank you. I think
12 that completes the purpose of tonight's meeting. So may
13 I have a motion to adjourn.

14 MR. ROE: So moved.

15 MR. BEILKE: Second?

16 MS. BAUMAN: Second.

17 MR. BEILKE: All in favor of adjourning say
18 aye.

19 ALL RESPOND: Aye.

20 MR. BEILKE: Opposed? We are adjourned.

21 (Proceedings concluded at 9:25 p.m.)
22
23
24
25

